

DUDEK

38 NORTH MARENGO AVENUE
PASADENA, CALIFORNIA 91101
T 626.204.9800 F 626.204.9834

MEMORANDUM

October 16, 2024

11898

To: Rachel Zadikov – Assistant Planner for the City of Calabasas
From: Noah Stamm – City of Calabasas Contract Arborist

Subject: Permit Peer Review Memo Letter for the submitted REVISED Arborist Report for the proposed Tennis Court Construction at 25201 Prado del Grandioso, Calabasas, California

1 Introduction

This memorandum provides the results of a third-party peer review of the re-submitted **revised** Arborist Report with associated Oak Tree Site Map prepared by ISA Certified Arborist Juan Farias with Natures Finest Arbor Service. In addition to the revised Arborist Report, the project's consulting engineers submitted an 'Administrative Plan Review Findings' document, which has been prepared to provide additional explanations and justifications as to why the tennis court is located where they are proposing it. The Arborist Report was prepared at the request of the property owner and applicant, David Kim, to inspect, evaluate, and assess the impacts of the proposed tennis court construction activities on the nearby protected coast oak trees (*Quercus agrifolia*) located in the far northwest portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso, Calabasas, California. After review of the original Oak Tree Arborist Report and a revised arborist report, two separate Permit Review Memo Letter Report were completed, the first was on July 16, 2024 by Dudek which included nine (9) recommendations that were required to be included in a Revised Arborist Report and on the associated Oak Tree Location Map. The second Permit Review Memo Letter Report was completed on August 30, 2024 by Dudek which included three (3) recommendations that were required to be included in Revised Arborist Report and on the associated Oak Tree Location Map.

Dudek's arborist originally conducted a visual Level 2 Basic Tree Assessment from the ground in June 2024 at the request of City of Calabasas Planner Rachel Zadikov, with the purpose of the site evaluation to confirm the validity of the Arborist Report, evaluate the overall health and structure of the on-site oak trees, and to address the proposed construction of a new tennis court in the rear yard area of the property and within the TPZ of coast live oak tree no. 1, ultimately requiring removal of that coast live oak tree. A Level 2 Basic Tree Risk Assessment consists of an ISA Certified Arborist walking completely around the trunk of a tree and look for defects in all visible areas of the tree from the ground, including surrounding areas. Typically, the assessment could include using a rubber mallet to sound the tree or a probe that can be used to evaluate open cavities. The TPZ is an area surrounding a tree and includes all area within the dripline of the tree, plus five feet beyond the dripline. This area cannot be less than 15 feet from the trunk of the tree. For Heritage oak trees (neither tree is a heritage tree), the area is increased to a minimum distance of 50 feet from the trunk.

The purpose of the revised Arborist Report is to address the recommendations prepared in the 'Permit Peer Review Memo Letter Report' by Dudek submitted in August 2024 and provide additional information regarding

the oak tree encroachment into the tree protection zones (TPZ) of the two (2) protected oak trees because of the proposed Tennis Court construction. Specifically, the updated Arborist Report provides brief Introduction and Observation sections, as well as a 'Recommendation', 'Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring', and 'Tree Management and Preservation' sections. As described in the original Arborist Report, the current scope of work includes the construction of a new Tennis Court area which will extend and encroach into the tree protection zone (TPZ) of coast live oak tree no. 1, ultimately resulting in the removal of coast live oak tree no. 1 to meet the construction plans. It should be noted that there was a second on-site protected 6-inch coast live oak tree located approximately 30 feet southwest of the coast live oak tree and 20 feet west of the proposed tennis court construction area (outside chain-link fence), which was not included within the original oak tree report and is not expected to be encroached upon during construction.

The purpose of this arborist peer review is to provide a review of the submitted Oak Tree Report and to ensure applicant compliance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City's Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines (April 1993).

2 Discussion and Recommendations

The revised arborist report and associated Oak Tree Site Map that were re-submitted in October 2024 were found to be complete. After review of the revised arborist report, Dudek is in agreement with the validity of the findings and additional information included within the report. Specifically, the revised arborist report incorporated a "Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring" section that states, "No program is necessary as in-lieu fees should cover the cost of any necessary mitigation." After discussing all replacement tree options with the City of Calabasas Planner, the applicant has decided to move forward with paying the in-lieu fee, rather than planting replacement trees; this suffices Recommendation No. 2 that requested, *"for the planting of the replacement tree for coast live oak tree no. 1, please elaborate and be more specific to the size, species, and proposed location of the replacement tree(s) (also show on the Tree Location Map). It should be noted that the replacement tree(s) shall be replaced at an inch for inch ratio, consistent with the City's Oak Tree Preservation Guidelines. And finally, the project's Mitigation and Monitoring Plan shall be submitted to the City for review and approval."* Also, the revised arborist report provides a description of the protective fencing that shall be installed around the edge of the protected oak tree no. 2 which is going to be protected-in-place; this suffices Recommendation No. 3 that requested, *"the installation of protective fencing shall be installed at the outermost edge of the "protected zone" of the oak tree prior to commencement of site construction. The fencing shall be a five-foot high chain link fence set in concrete footings with posts installed every eight feet and two feet deep. It is recommended that the trees be irrigated both prior to and after the installation of the privacy fence to provide a deep soaking beneath the trees' drip lines, but not within approximately four feet of their trunks. An ISA Certified Consulting Arborist shall be on-site during all site construction activities in or around the "protection zone" of the protected oak trees."* Finally, the resubmitted Oak Tree Site Map has identified the location of the two on-site coast live oak trees and has labeled which tree is proposed to be removed and which is going to be protected-in-place. The Oak Tree Site Map also identifies the dripline, TPZ, and protective fencing location. Because the applicant has decided to move forward with paying the in-lieu fee, rather than planting replacement trees, there are no locations of replacement trees labeled on the map.

3 Conclusion

Based on the information provided in the submitted revised Arborist Report and on the Oak Tree Site Map by the Project's certified arborist, Dudek is in agreement that the revised Arborist Report and accompanied Oak Tree Site Map was prepared in accordance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City's Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines. **Therefore, the request is warranted to grant approval of the applied permit.**

In Dudek's opinion, the proposed installation of a new Tennis Court area will extend and encroach into the TPZ of coast live oak tree no. 1, ultimately resulting in the removal of coast live oak tree no. 1 to meet the construction plans. The applicant has decided to move forward with paying the in-lieu fee, rather than planting replacement trees. The second on-site protected 6-inch coast live oak tree shall be protected-in-place and the proposed construction will likely not impact any of the trees small roots and resulting in minimal if any, future damage or long-term adverse impacts to the coast live oak tree. Temporary tree protective fencing shall be installed at the edges of the coast live oak tree's TPZ and additional tree protection measures will be used to reduce soil and root problems going forward.

This report provides conclusions and recommendations based on an examination of the trees and surrounding site by an ISA Certified Arborist. Arborists are tree specialists who use their education, knowledge, training, and experience to examine trees, recommend measures to enhance the beauty and health of trees, and attempt to reduce the risk of living near trees. Arborists cannot detect every condition that could possibly lead to the failure of a tree. Trees are living organisms that fail in ways not fully understood. Conditions are often hidden within trees and below ground. Arborists cannot guarantee that a tree will be healthy or safe under all circumstances, or for a specified period of time. There are no guarantees that a tree's condition will not change over a short or long period due to weather or cultural or environmental conditions. Trees can be managed but not controlled. To live near trees is to accept some degree of risk.

If you have any questions or require any additional information, please call me at 760.642.8379.

Sincerely,



Noah Stamm, Calabasas Contract Arborist
ISA-Certified Arborist WE - 11995A
ISA TRAQ Qualified

Att: Attachment 1, Representative Site Photographs

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report

25201 Prado del Grandioso

Representative Site Photographs



1. Overview photograph of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso. The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken facing east. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.



2. Overview photograph of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso. The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken facing north/NW. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report

25201 Prado del Grandioso

Representative Site Photographs



3. Overview photograph of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso (red arrow). The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken facing west. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.



4. Photograph of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso. The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken facing west. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report

25201 Prado del Grandioso

Representative Site Photographs



5. Photograph of the base of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso (red arrow). The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken looking down facing west. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.



6. Photograph of the base of a coast live oak tree located in the NW portion of the rear yard of 25201 Prado del Grandioso (red arrow). The applicant is proposing to construct a new tennis court, thus having to remove the coast live oak tree. Photograph taken looking down facing east. Note the stakes are the outline of the tennis court.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report

25201 Prado del Grandioso

Representative Site Photographs



7. Photograph of a second coast live oak tree located approx. 30 feet SW of Oak Tree no.1 and approx. 20 feet west of the outside perimeter of the tennis court construction activities. Photograph taken facing NE. Note: this tree was not included in the original Oak Tree Report and will need to be added to the revised Oak Tree Report.



8. Photograph of a second coast live oak tree located approx. 30 feet SW of Oak Tree no.1 and approx. 20 feet west of the outside perimeter of the tennis court construction activities (yellow arrow is the perimeter of the tennis court). Photograph taken facing south. Note: this tree was not included in the original Oak Tree Report and will need to be added to the revised Oak Tree Report.

Photographs were taken on June 12, 2024