

DUDEK

38 NORTH MARENGO AVENUE
PASADENA, CALIFORNIA 91101
T 626.204.9800 F 626.204.9834

MEMORANDUM

May 23, 2024

11898

To: Jaclyn Rackerby – Planner for the City of Calabasas
From: Noah Stamm – City of Calabasas Contract Arborist

Subject: Revised Permit Peer Review Memo Letter Report of the submitted Revised Oak Tree Report (dated May 13, 2024) for construction of a new single-family residential structure at 22534 Calipatria Drive, Calabasas, California

1 Introduction

This memorandum provides Dudek’s findings regarding a third-party review of the 2nd revised Oak Tree Report that includes an associated Oak Tree Map (with revision date of May 13, 2024) prepared by ISA Registered Consulting Arborist Richard Campbell. It should be noted that there was a prior revised Oak Tree Report and Oak Tree Map dated March 21, 2024, which along with the original Oak Tree Report (dated February 9, 2024) were prepared at the request of the property owner and applicant, Mori Mahmoud, to survey and conduct an analysis/assessment of the impact of the proposed construction activities on three (3) protected coast oak trees (*Quercus agrifolia*) located along the easterly up-slope of the rear yard of 22534 Calipatria Drive, Calabasas, California. Specifically, each of the Oak Tree Reports address the proposed construction related activities associated with construction of a new single-family home which would require the possible removal of one (1) coast live oak tree and encroachments within the tree protection zone (TPZ) of two additional coast live oak trees. After review of the original Oak Tree Report, a Permit Review Memo Letter Report was completed on March 12, 2024, by Dudek which included two (2) recommendations/additional sections and conditions that were required to be included in a Revised Oak Tree Report and on the associated Oak Tree Map. One of those recommendations were revised and addressed in the first revised Oak Tree Report, however, in the follow-up Memo Letter Report by Dudek dated April 29, 2024 the request was not warranted to grant approval of the applied permit until the Oak Tree Report was revised to include the second recommendation to include a “Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring section” that describes the mitigation for the proposed removal of coast live oak tree MOT-1 and for those to remain but will be encroached, a monitoring schedule will need to be created to monitor the health of the trees over a 5-year period. Dudek’s arborist originally conducted a visual Level 2 Basic Tree Assessment from the ground on February 27, 2024 at the request of City of Calabasas Planner Jaclyn Rackerby, to confirm the validity of the original Oak Tree Report and Associated Oak Tree Map, visually inspect and evaluate the health, structure, and locations of the oak trees identified within the Oak Tree Report, and to address the proposed removal and/or encroachment within the tree protection zones (TPZs) of the on-site protected coast live oak trees (*Quercus agrifolia*) identified within the project’s original Oak Tree Report and on the associated Oak Tree Map, as a result of the grading and construction activities associated with construction of the proposed single-family residential structure.

As identified within the original and revised Oak Tree Reports and identified on the associated Oak Tree Maps, the property includes three (3) on-site City of Calabasas defined protected coast live oak tree located along the eastern side of the property, on an existing up-slope manufactured slope. Each of the trees have been tagged with a special metal tag to identify each tree (tag numbers MOT-1 through MOT-3). Oak tree MOT-1 is located near the driveway entrance next to a plaster pillar in the northeast portion of the property. Due to the proposed construction related activities and footprint of the home, oak tree MOT-1 is proposed to be removed. Oak tree MOT-2 is located in the center of the easterly side yard up-slope area and is proposed to be protected-in-place. And oak tree MOT-3 is located in the southeastern portion of the side yard up-slope area and is also proposed to be protected in place. As addressed in the Oak Tree Report, the canopies of oak trees MOT-2 and MOT-3 are not expected to be negatively impacted or pruned due to the construction related activities. However, as part of a project it's proposed that a new concrete block retaining wall will be constructed approximately 6 feet to the west and downslope from the trunks of oak trees MOT-2 and MOT-3. The existing retaining wall is also proposed to be removed as well. It's anticipated that the construction of the new concrete block retaining wall will likely cause moderate to significant root damage within the TPZs of oak trees MOT-2 and MOT-3. Although the proposes construction activities will encroach into the TPZs of oak trees MOT-2 and MOT-3, the Oak Tree Report states there may be no long-term negative impacts expected to affect the root or canopy areas of the two trees.

As noted above, Dudek's arborist completed the site inspection to verify the validity of the recommendations regarding the coast live oak trees and the proposed project related activities and therefore, will likely require the removal of oak tree MOT-1 and will likely encroach into the TPZs of oak trees MOT-2 and MOT-3. The TPZ is an area surrounding a tree and includes all area within the dripline of the tree, plus five feet beyond the dripline. This area cannot be less than 15 feet from the trunk of the tree. For Heritage oak trees, the area is increased to a minimum distance of 50 feet from the trunk. The roots of the two protected-in-place oak trees will likely be impacted due to the construction of a new retaining wall, however, due to the location of the existing retaining wall, it will not be known the extent of roots that will be encountered and thus, hand-digging shall be conducted in the area of the new retaining wall. Oak tree MOT-1 is proposed to be removed due to the proposed location of the house and 2-car garage, and thus will not be protected-in-place.

The purpose of this arborist peer review is to provide a review of the submitted Oak Tree Report and to ensure applicant compliance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City's Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines (April 1993).

2 Discussion and Recommendations

The second revised Oak Tree Report and associated Oak Tree Map was found to be complete. After review of the revised Oak Tree Report dated May 13, 2024, Dudek is in agreement with the validity of the findings and information included in the revised Oak Tree Report and on the associated Oak Tree Map.

The second revised Oak Tree Report clearly illustrated which trees are going to remain on and off the property, and which are going to be removed/relocated and adding two additional coast live oak trees as part of the mitigation for the removal of MOT-1 and on page 7 of the Oak Tree Report, a 'Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring' section was added to the report, which is found to be in accordance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines, 'Section VIII, Standards of Performance and Permitted Work, Part 3. Monitoring. The

“Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring section” included mitigation for the trees proposed to be removed and/or monitoring for all oak tree species that were a part of the on-site review, including trees with their “protection zones” encroached during on-property construction activities. The coast live oak tree (MOT-1) which is proposed to be removed will include the on-site planting of two (2) 36-inch box sized oak trees, and the two remaining coast live oak trees that will remain but will likely be encroached include a monitoring schedule to monitor the health of the trees over a 5-year period. The Oak Tree Map was revised to show the location of the addition of two (2) new 3-inch coast live oak trees to mitigate for the removal of a 5-inch coast live oak tree which are addressed in the “Mitigation, Maintenance, and Monitoring” section.

3 Conclusion

Based on the information provided in the submitted revised Oak Tree Reports and associated Oak Tree Maps (dated May 13, 2024 and March 21, 2024) prepared by the Project’s certified consulting arborist, Dudek is in agreement that the revised Oak Tree Report was prepared in accordance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City’s Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines and the Oak Tree Map was updated to suffice the recommendations from the original Oak Tree Report Peer Review Memo Letter. **Therefore, the request is warranted to grant approval of the applied permit.**

As mentioned above, Dudek’s arborist only performed a Level 2 visual inspection of the three coast live oak trees; we did not perform a Level 3 assessment of the tree to determine the structural stability of the tree and/or locations of each of the tree roots. This report provides conclusions and recommendations based on an examination of the tree and surrounding site by an ISA Certified Arborist. Arborists are tree specialists who use their education, knowledge, training, and experience to examine trees, recommend measures to enhance the beauty and health of trees, and attempt to reduce the risk of living near trees.

Arborists cannot detect every condition that could possibly lead to the failure of a tree. Trees are living organisms that fail in ways not fully understood. Conditions are often hidden within trees and below ground. Arborists cannot guarantee that a tree will be healthy or safe under all circumstances, or for a specified period of time. There are no guarantees that a tree's condition will not change over a short or long period due to weather or cultural or environmental conditions. Trees can be managed but not controlled. To live near trees is to accept some degree of risk. However, it is recommended that the applicant/property owner consider the recommendation to move the proposed medical office facility to reduce the number of impacted trees.

If you have any questions or require any additional information, please call me at 760.642.8379.

Sincerely,



Noah Stamm, Calabasas Contract Arborist
ISA-Certified Arborist WE - 11995A
ISA TRAQ Qualified