

MEMORANDUM

June 26, 2023

11898

To: Savina Johal – Assistant Planner for the City of Calabasas
From: Noah Stamm – City of Calabasas Contract Arborist

Subject: *Peer-Review Memo Letter for submitted Oak Tree Report for 3901 Prado del Trigo, Calabasas, California*

1 Introduction

This memorandum provides the results of a third-party peer review of the submitted Oak Tree Report (dated June 9, 2023) and associated Oak Tree Location Map completed by Richard Campbell, Landscape Architect. The Oak Tree Report was prepared at the request of the property owner (applicant) based on the applicant's concern for the health of an existing 'heritage' coast live oak tree (*Quercus agrifolia*) and proposed new landscape construction activities that may possibly encroach in the tree's Tree Protection Zone (TPZ). The existing coast live oak tree (#SOT-1) is located at the base of a small, manufactured slope in the northwest portion of the rear yard of the property. The landscape construction related activities will take place in the rear yard of 3901 Prado del Trigo, Calabasas, California and the existing coast live oak tree is to be protected-in-place. The proposed landscape plan activities include the demolition of an existing pergola, an existing concrete patio, and removal of an existing sycamore tree, which are located approximately 20 to 25 feet east of the protected-in-place coast live oak tree; additional activities include demolition of an existing grill and countertop and relocating existing flagstone pavers located along the west side of the single-family residential structure. A new detached pergola is proposed at the rear of the structure along with two new countertop locations within the new pergola. A new reinforced concrete masonry unit (CMU) block fire pit, a reinforced CMU block seat wall, and precast concrete pavers will be constructed at the base of the coast live oak tree, within the eastern portion of the tree's TPZ. It was noted within the Oak Tree Report that the crown of the coast live oak tree is not expected to be negatively impacted by or pruned for clearance for the proposed new landscape construction activities. However, with the construction activities of a concrete CMU block seat wall approximately 20 feet to the north and downhill from the trunk may require minor root pruning. Although there are aspects of the proposed landscape construction activities that will encroach into the 50-foot TPZ of the coast live oak tree, no long-term negative impacts are expected to affect the health/roots or crown of the coast live oak tree.

Dudek conducted a visual Level 2 Basic Tree Assessment from the ground on June 15, 2023, to visually inspect and evaluate the health, structure and location of the oak tree identified within the Oak Tree Report; the applicant was present at the time of the inspection/site visit, but a City Planner was not. A Level 2 Basic Tree Risk Assessment consists of an ISA Certified Arborist walking completely around the trunk of a tree and look for defects in all visible areas of the tree from the ground, including surrounding areas. Typically, the assessment could include using a rubber mallet to sound the tree or a probe that can be used to evaluate open cavities. The purpose of the Oak Tree

Report and the site inspection is to address the focused tree survey of the single protected coast live oak tree growing within the vicinity of the proposed landscape improvements. Dudek completed the site inspection to verify the validity of the recommendations regarding the coast live oak tree that are included within the Oak Tree Report for the proposed project related activities and therefore, will minimally be impacted or encounter long term negative impacts by the landscape improvement activities in the rear yard area. As mentioned above, the TPZ of the coast live oak tree will be encroached upon. The TPZ is an area surrounding a tree and includes all area within the dripline of the tree, plus five feet beyond the dripline. This area cannot be less than 15 feet from the trunk of the tree. For Heritage oak trees, the area is increased to a minimum distance of 50 feet from the trunk; this oak tree is considered a heritage oak tree, thus has a 50-foot TPZ. According to the Oak Tree Report, associated Oak Tree Map, and the Project's Site Plan, the proposed concrete CMU block seat wall, CMU block fit pit area, and concrete paver improvements are located approximately 20 feet to the north and downhill from the trunk and outside of the tree's dripline. The landscape improvement activities likely will not impact the future health of the coast live oak tree with the proper installation of tree protective fencing and use of hand digging within the TPZ of the tree.

The purpose of this arborist peer review is to ensure applicant compliance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City's Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines (April, 1993).

2 Discussion and recommendations

Dudek's arborist found the submitted Oak Tree Report and associated Oak Tree Map to be generally accurate to the observed site conditions and was found to be complete. The coast live oak tree is a mature, heritage, multi-stem coast live oak tree that exhibits fair health with a poor- to- fair structure due to a multi-trunk form with co-dominant trunks and branches; the tree is located near the base of an east facing irrigated/manufactured slope in the rear yard of the property. The downhill side of the tree (east and north sides of the tree's trunk) exhibit fill of the trunk and root zone and a rock retaining wall that was built into the manufactured slope. The tree exhibited a well-balanced crown with good vigor and green foliage throughout; the tree, however, does show signs of deadwood and areas where prior stub-cut pruning occurred. Further, there were signs of minor insects and/or disease observed at the time of the Level 2 Assessment of the coast live oak tree. As mentioned above the tree is a multi-stem coast live oak tree and considered a "heritage" tree. A "heritage" tree, according to the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines, is a tree that has a trunk or combined trunk diameter larger than 24-inches in diameter at standard height (DSH - 4 ½-feet above natural grade). The tree has trunk diameters of 9, 10, 12, 13, and 14 inches DSH, is approximately 25 feet tall, and has an estimated crown width of 30 feet at its widest point across. It was apparent that the oak tree is not a native oak tree and was transplanted to its current location, most likely when the development was constructed. Representative photographs of the five coast live oak trees are shown in *Attachment 1 – Representative Site Photographs*.

Dudek is in agreement with the validity of the findings and information included in the Oak Tree Report and associated Oak Tree Map, which identifies the oak tree within the limits of disturbance, provides a description of the oak tree (including health and locations), as well as recommendations for tree protection and preservation. Because the construction of a the proposed concrete CMU block seat wall, CMU block fit pit area, and concrete paver improvements are located approximately 20 feet to the north and downhill from the trunk and outside of the

tree's dripline, will encroach into the TPZ's of the coast live oak tree, all work performed within the TPZ of this oak tree should be performed within the presence of a qualified oak tree consultant and all work should be performed with the use of hand tools only. To protect the tree during construction, 5-foot-tall tree protective fencing will be placed around the TPZ limits of the tree. An ISA Certified Arborist shall be retained to supervise and monitor the condition of the existing protected oak tree throughout the proposed landscape improvement activities.

3 Conclusion

Based on the information provided in the submitted Oak Tree Report by the Project's certified landscape architect, Dudek is in agreement that the Oak Tree Report was prepared in accordance with the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Ordinance (Chapter 17.32.010 of the City's Municipal Code) and the City of Calabasas Oak Tree Preservation and Protection Guidelines. Therefore, the request is warranted to grant approval of the Oak Tree Report and associated Oak Tree Location Map.

In Dudek's opinion, the proposed landscape plan activities including the demolition of an existing pergola, an existing concrete patio, and removal of an existing sycamore tree, which are located approximately 20 to 25 feet east of the protected-in-place coast live oak tree, as well as the demolition of an existing grill and countertop and relocating existing flagstone pavers located along the west side of the single-family residential structure. A new detached pergola is proposed at the rear of the structure along with two new countertop locations within the new pergola. A new reinforced concrete masonry unit (CMU) block fire pit, a reinforced CMU block seat wall, and precast concrete pavers will be constructed at the base of the coast live oak tree, within the eastern portion of the tree's TPZ. These landscape construction activities that will encroach into the 50-foot TPZ of the coast live oak tree, however, no long-term negative impacts are expected to affect the health/roots or crown of the coast live oak tree. Tree protective fencing will be installed around the trunk of the tree and additional tree protection measures will be used to reduce soil and root problems going forward.

As mentioned earlier, Dudek's arborist only performed a Level 2 visual inspection of the protected coast live oak tree; we did not perform a Level 3 assessment of the trees to determine the structural stability of the tree and/or location of the tree's roots. This report provides conclusions and recommendations based on an examination of the trees and surrounding site by an ISA Certified Arborist. Arborists are tree specialists who use their education, knowledge, training, and experience to examine trees, recommend measures to enhance the beauty and health of trees, and attempt to reduce the risk of living near trees. Arborists cannot detect every condition that could possibly lead to the failure of a tree. Trees are living organisms that fail in ways not fully understood. Conditions are often hidden within trees and below ground. Arborists cannot guarantee that a tree will be healthy or safe under all circumstances, or for a specified period of time. There are no guarantees that a tree's condition will not change over a short or long period due to weather or cultural or environmental conditions. Trees can be managed but not controlled. To live near trees is to accept some degree of risk.

If you have any questions or require any additional information, please call me at 760.642.8379.

Sincerely,



Noah Stamm, Calabasas Contract Arborist
ISA-Certified Arborist WE - 11995A
ISA TRAQ Qualified

Att: Attachment 1, Representative Site Photographs

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report for 3901 Prado del Trigo

Representative Site Photographs



1. Overview photograph of the coast live oak tree (Tag #SOT-1) located in the northwest portion of the rear yard of 3901 Prado del Trigo. Photograph taken facing north. Note the location of the work to be performed (red arrow) in location to the TPZ of the tree.



2. Overview photograph of the coast live oak tree (Tag #SOT-1) located in the northwest portion of the rear yard of 3901 Prado del Trigo. Photograph taken facing west.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report for 3901 Prado del Trigo

Representative Site Photographs



3. Overview photograph of coast live oak tree (Tag #SOT-1) located in the northwest portion of the rear yard of 3901 Prado del Trigo. Photograph taken standing above and looking down at the tree facing east.



4. Photograph of the base of coast live oak tree #SOT-1 and the existing retaining wall on the downhill (east side of the tree's trunk). Photograph taken facing southwest.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report for 3901 Prado del Trigo Representative Site Photographs



5. Photograph of the base of coast live oak tree #SOT-1 and the existing retaining wall on the downhill (east side of the tree's trunk). Photograph taken facing north.



6. Photograph of the base of coast live oak tree #SOT-1 and the existing retaining wall on the downhill (east side of the tree's trunk). Photograph taken facing east.

Attachment 1 – Healthy Oak Tree Report for 3901 Prado del Trigo Representative Site Photographs



7. Photograph of the base of coast live oak tree #SOT-1 and the existing retaining wall on the downhill (east side of the tree's trunk). Photograph taken facing south.

Photographs were taken on June 15, 2023