# CITY of CALABASAS 2030 General Plan

# 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT

# **BACKGROUND REPORT**

JANUARY 2021

CITY OF CALABASAS
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
100 CIVIC CENTER WAY
CALABASAS, CA 91302



## City of Calabasas 2030 General Plan 2021-2029 Housing Element Background Report

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Demographic Profile	C3-1
	A. Population Growth	C3-1
	B. Age Characteristics	
	C. Race and Ethnicity	
	D. Employment	
	E. Household Type	
	F. Household Income	
II.	Calabasas Housing Needs	C3-7
	A. Rental Market and Affordability	
	B. Homeowner Market and Affordability	
	C. Housing Problems	
	D. Housing Adequacy	
	E. Senior Housing Needs	
	F. Workforce Housing Needs	
	G. Other Special Needs Groups	
	H. Assisted Housing At-Risk of Conversion	
	I. Future Housing Growth Needs	
III.	Housing Constraints	C3-27
	A. Governmental Constraints	
	B. Market Constraints	
	C. Environmental and Infrastructure Constraints	
IV.	Review of Program Accomplishments	C3-55
V.	Energy Conservation Opportunities	C3-65

## LIST OF TABLES

<u>Dem</u>	nographic Profile	
1	Regional Population Growth Trends	C3-1
2	Age Distribution	C3-2
3	Racial and Ethnic Composition	C3-3
4	Employment Sectors	C3-4
5	Major Employers	C3-4
6	Household Characteristics	C3-5
7	State Income Categories	C3-6
8	Household Income Distribution	C3-6
Hous	sing Needs	
9	Housing Types	C3-7
10	Rental Rates	
11	Maximum Affordable Rents	
12	Affordability Assumptions for ADUs	C3-11
13	Regional Home Values	C3-12
14	Home Values by Unit Size	C3-13
15	Maximum Affordable Housing Costs	
16	Housing Overpayment	
17	Lower Income Renter Overpayment	
18	Overcrowded Households	
19	Age of Housing Stock	
20	Characteristics of Senior Population	
21	Special Needs Households	
22	Assisted Housing At-Risk of Conversion	C3-25
23	Regional Housing Needs Assessment	C3-26
	sing Constraints	
24	Residential Land Use Districts	
25	Residential Development Standards	
26	Parking Requirements	
27	Housing Types by Zoning Category	
28	Development Fees for Residential Projects	
29	City Development Fees for Hypothetical Project	
30	Status of Homes Purchase and Improvement Loans	C3-48
	gram Accomplishments	
31	2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments	C3-55
32	Progress Towards 2014-2021 Quantified Objectives	C3-62

The Housing Element Background Report includes an analysis of demographic, economic, housing, and special needs characteristics and trends in Calabasas. The analysis is intended to identify issues that affect the City's existing and future housing needs. As the results of the 2020 U.S. Census were not available as of this writing, the 2014-2018 American Community Survey (ACS) provides the basis for much of the data contained in the Report.

## I. DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE

Demographic changes can affect the type and amount of housing that is needed in a community. This section presents the population, age, race/ethnicity, and employment characteristics of Calabasas residents.

#### A. Population Growth and Trends

Table 1 presents population growth trends in Calabasas, and compares this growth to neighboring jurisdictions and the entire County of Los Angeles. Calabasas experienced an eight percent increase in population during the 1990s, fairly comparable to the seven percent growth evidenced Countywide, yet below the twelve percent growth level experienced in nearby Westlake Village and Thousand Oaks. Between 2000 and 2010, the Calabasas population increased by a robust fifteen percent to 23,058 residents, representing a net increase in approximately 3,000 new residents. This increase was significantly more than neighboring cities and the County as a whole.

During the most recent decade, Calabasas' population increased by five percent to almost 24,200 residents. This increase, while slower than in the 1990s and 2000s, is still greater than other Conejo Valley jurisdictions and slightly higher than the County (4%).

**Table 1: Regional Population Growth Trends 1990-2020** 

rabio ii kegionai i opananon oromin rionao 1000 2020							
					Per	cent Cha	nge
Jurisdiction	1990	2000	2010	2020	1990- 2000	2000- 2010	2010- 2020
Agoura Hills	20,390	20,537	20,330	20,566	1%	-1%	1%
Calabasas	18,527	20,033	23,058	24,193	8%	15%	5%
Thousand Oaks	104,352	117,005	126,683	126,484	12%	8%	-0.2%
Westlake Village	7,455	8,368	8,270	8,212	12%	-1%	-1%
Los Angeles County	8,863,164	9,519,338	9,818,605	10,172,951	7%	3%	4%

Source: U.S. Census 1990, 2000 and 2010; Dept. of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates.

In terms of future trends, the Southern California Association of Governments' (SCAG) Demographics and Growth Forecast projects a modest 2.8 percent increase in Calabasas' population over the next 25 years, for an estimated 2045 population of 24,900 residents.

### B. AGE CHARACTERISTICS

Housing need is impacted by the age characteristics of a community, with different age groups having different income levels and family types that influence housing needs.

Table 2 shows the age distribution of Calabasas residents in 2000 and 2020, and compares this to the age distribution Countywide. As indicated in the table, in 2020, 24 percent of Calabasas' residents were children under the age of 18, compared to 28 percent of the City's population in 2000. The decline in children is further evidenced by the decline in family households with children in Calabasas, which dropped from 43 to 35 percent over the past two decades (refer to Table 6 later in this chapter). Similarly, between 2009-2019, K-12 public school enrollment for schools within Calabasas decreased by six percent (source: Las Virgenes Unified School District).

The young adult (25-44 years) age group experienced a large shift over the last 20 years. Both the proportion and number of young adults declined significantly during the decade, decreasing from 29 to 21 percent of the population, and declining by over 675 residents. This trend is a reflection of the aging in place of young adults into middle age, and the limited number of new young adults moving into the community. Conversely, the middle age population increased by almost 1,800 residents since 2000 and saw their proportion of the City's population grow from 28 percent to 30 percent. This shift in growth from young adults to middle age is indicative of the area's high for-sale housing costs and limited rental opportunities.

Finally, the most dramatic change in age distribution in Calabasas over the last 20 years was in the senior population (65 years and older). The percentage of seniors more than doubled from 8 to 17 percent during this time and included an increase of approximately 2,350 residents. The population of Calabasas, as a whole, is aging. The American Community Survey puts the median age of Calabasas at 42.9 years, an increase of 4.4 years since 2000 and more than six years older than the median age of 36.7 years for the County. Calabasas has made significant progress in expanding housing options for seniors, with development of the 75 unit Canyon Creek Apartments and 60 unit Horizons 55 active senior housing communities, and entitlements for the 42 unit Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments.

Table 2: Age Distribution 2000-2020

	2000		2020		
Age Group	Persons	Percent	Persons	Percent	L.A. Co.
Preschool (0-4 years)	1,223	6%	895	4%	6%
School Age (5-17 years)	4,346	22%	4,790	20%	16%
College Age (18-24 years)	1,323	7%	1,935	8%	9%
Young Adults (25-44 years)	5,832	29%	5,153	21%	30%
Middle Age (45-64 years)	5,593	28%	7,355	30%	25%
Seniors (65-74 years)	1,097	5%	2,589	11%	8%
Frail Elderly (75+ years)	619	3%	1,476	6%	6%
TOTAL	20,003	100%	24,193	100%	100%
Median Age	38.5 y	ears	42.9 y	ears	36.7 years

Source: U.S. Census 2000; ACS 2014-2018; Dept of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates.

#### C. RACE AND ETHNICITY

Table 3 displays the racial/ethnic distribution of Calabasas' population and compares it to the Countywide distribution. The City experienced some change in ethnic composition over the decade, with Whites continuing to make up the largest majority of the City's population (76% in 2020 compared to 84% in 2000). In contrast, Whites comprise only 26% of the population Countywide.

The percentage of Asians (10%) and Hispanics (8%) increased slightly while African Americans (<1%), and American Indians (<1%) in Calabasas remained relatively constant from 2000 to 2020, showing relatively minor increases in number. The small size of the City's minority population stands in sharp contrast to the population of Los Angeles County as a whole.

Table 3: Racial and Ethnic Composition 2000-2020

	2000		2020		
Race/Ethnicity	Persons	Percent	Persons	Percent	L.A. Co.
White	17,898	84%	18,387	76%	26%
Asian/Pacific Islander	1,656	8%	2,419	10%	15%
Hispanic	1,004	5%	1,935	8%	48%
Other	513	2%	1,210	5%	3%
African American	256	1%	194	<1%	8%
Native American	29	<1%	48	<1%	<1%
TOTAL	21,356	100%	24,193	100%	100%

Source: U.S. Census 2000; ACS 2014-2018; Dept of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates.

#### D. EMPLOYMENT

The Southern California Association of Governments' (SCAG) Demographics and Growth Forecast estimates there was a total of 20,500 jobs in Calabasas in 2016, and projects a modest 1.5 percent increase in Calabasas' employment by 2045, for an estimated 20,800 jobs<sup>1</sup>. SCAG's Local Profile for Calabasas further breaks down employment by sector (refer to Table 4). As of 2017, professional and management was the largest employment sector at 22 percent, followed by finance (16.5%), leisure (15.5%) and education (13.3%). While the percentage of jobs in the leisure and education sectors increased between 2007 and 2017, construction and manufacturing sectors saw decreases.

**Table 4: Employment Sectors 2017** 

Industry Sector	% Total Jobs
Professional & Management	22%
Finance	16.5%
Leisure	15.5%
Education	13.3%
Retail	9.6%
Information	4.9%
Manufacturing	4.5%
Transportation	3.6%
Public Administration	3.4%
Other Services (excluding Public Administration)	2.4%
Construction	2.2%
Wholesale Trade	2.1%
TOTAL	100%

Source: SCAG, Profile of the City of Calabasas, May 2019.

Table 5 shows the top ten employers in Calabasas in 2020. As can be seen, a significant number of these jobs are in the education, finance, professional and retail sectors.

**Table 5: Major Employers** 

>	Harbor Freight Tools	All Motorists Insurance Agency	
>	Las Virgenes Unified School District	Alcatel Internetworkings, Inc.	
>	Cheesecake Factory, Inc.	Ama Waterways	
>	Viewpoint Education Foundation	> Xperi	
>	Keysight Technologies	Bob Smith BMW and Mini	

Source: City of Calabasas, June 2020.

Over 90 percent of persons working in Calabasas commute in from outside the City, an indication of the shortage of local affordable housing opportunities for the community's workforce.<sup>2</sup> Similarly, Calabasas residents also face long commutes, with 35 percent of the City's employed residents commuting 25 miles or more to work (OnTheMap).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> SCAG. Connect SoCal Demographics and Growth Forecast Technical Report. Adopted on May 7, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> U.S. Census Bureau - 2017 OnTheMap Application. http://onthemap.ces.census.gov/.

#### E. HOUSEHOLD TYPE

A household is defined as all persons living in a housing unit. Families are a subset of households. They include persons living together who are related by blood, marriage, or adoption. A single person living alone is also a household. "Other" households are unrelated people residing in the same dwelling unit. Group quarters, such as dormitories or convalescent homes, are not considered households.

Table 6 illustrates household characteristics in Calabasas in 2000 and 2020, and compares it to the Countywide distribution. In 2020, Calabasas was home to 8,918 households. The City had an average household size of 2.71 persons and an average family size of 3.10 persons, indicating minimal change from 2000.

Families comprise the majority of households in Calabasas (75%), including families with children (35%), and those without children (40%). Over the past two decades, the proportion of families with children has decreased from 43 to 35 percent of all households. In contrast, the proportion of family households without children increased from 33 to 40 percent, and single-person households increased from 17 to 19. Nearly 70 percent of the City's household growth between 2000-2020 was due to an increase in childless family households, with 26 percent of this growth attributable to single person households. These trends reflect the aging in place of Calabasas' existing households and the limited number of new families with children moving into the community due in part to high housing costs.

Table 6: Household Characteristics 2000-2020

	2000				
Household Type	Households	Percent	Households	Percent	L.A. Co.
Families	5,543	77%	6,675	75%	66%
With children	(3,129)	(43%)	(3,121)	(35%)	(27%)
With no children	(2,414)	(33%)	(3,567)	(40%)	(39%)
Singles	1,228	17%	1,662	19%	26%
Other non-families	458	6%	581	6%	8%
TOTAL	7,229	100%	8,918	100%	100%
Avg Household Size	2.76		2.71		3.01
Avg Family Size	3.14 3.10		3.69		

Source: U.S. Census 2000; ACS 2014-2018; Dept of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates

#### F. HOUSEHOLD INCOME

Household income is one of the most important factors affecting housing opportunity. It is also crucial in determining a household's ability to balance housing costs with the other basic necessities of life.

The State and Federal government classify household income into several groupings based upon the relationship to the County adjusted median income (AMI), adjusted for household size. The State of California utilizes the income groups presented in Table 7, which are thus used throughout the Housing Element.

**Table 7: State Income Categories 2020** 

	% County	2020 L.A. County Income Limits				
Income Category	Area Median Income (AMI)	1 person household	2 person household	3 person household		
Extremely Low	0-30% AMI	\$23,700	\$27,050	\$30,450		
Very Low	0-50% AMI	\$39,450	\$45,050	\$50,700		
Low	51-80% AMI	\$63,100	\$72,100	\$81,100		
Moderate	81-120% AMI	\$64,900	\$74,200	\$83,500		
Above Moderate	120%+ AMI	>\$64,900	>\$74,200	>\$83,500		

Source: California Dept of Housing and Community Development, 2020 Income Limits.

Table 8 presents the distribution of household income in Calabasas by income category measured as a percentage of the County median. Above median income households (>100% AMI) comprise the vast majority of households in Calabasas, at 67 percent. Despite the City's overall affluence, however, over 2,300 Calabasas households earn lower incomes (<80% AMI). While relatively limited in number (8% of households), extremely low income (ELI) households (<30% AMI) have significant housing needs. According to CHAS Data compiled by HUD, nearly 90 percent of the City's ELI households are spending more than half their incomes on housing costs, and 55% of the City's ELI households are renters, a group particularly vulnerable to rising rents. The City of Calabasas funds a rental assistance program to assist extremely low and very low income senior and disabled renters to remain in the community, and provides ongoing monthly rental assistance to approximately 50 households through this program.

**Table 8: Household Income Distribution 2016** 

Income Level	Households	Percent
Extremely Low Income (0-30% AMI)	684	8%
Very Low Income (31-50% AMI)	665	8%
Low Income (51-80% AMI)	1,025	12%
Median Income (80-100% AMI)	473	5%
Above Median Income (>100% AMI)	5,804	67%
TOTAL	8,651	100%

Source: SCAG Pre-Certified Local Housing Data, August 2020.

AMI – Area Median Income

Note: Household count differs from 2020 Dept of Finance count depicted in Table 6.

## II. CALABASAS HOUSING NEEDS

Calabasas enjoys high quality residential neighborhoods, a strong local employment base, a high level of public services and a scenic natural setting, all of which contribute to the community's attractiveness as a place to live and work. However, the community's desirability has continued to place upward pressure on the housing market, making it increasingly difficult for key members of the community to live here – workforce, seniors, and grown children of current residents.

To help understand the nature and extent of housing needs in Calabasas, this section provides an overview of these needs as they relate to:

- Renter and Homeowner Affordability
- Housing Adequacy
- Seniors and Other Special Needs Groups
- Workforce Housing Needs
- Assisted Housing At-Risk of Conversion
- Regional Housing Needs

By way of background, Calabasas contained 9,230 housing units in 2020. The range of housing types reflects the City's largely hillside topography and peripheral suburban nature. Three-quarters of the City's housing is comprised of single-family units, either attached or detached, while multi-family apartments and condominiums account for almost one-quarter (23%) of the housing stock. The City's one mobile home park - Calabasas Village Mobile Estates with 210 units – comprises two percent of the housing in Calabasas.

**Table 9: Housing Types 2020** 

Unit Type	Units	Percent
Single-Family (SF) Detached	6,223	67%
SF Attached	663	7%
Total Single-Family	6,886	75%
2 to 4 Units	500	5%
5 or more units	1,613	17%
Total Multi-Family	2,113	23%
Mobile Homes & Other <sup>1</sup>	231	2%
TOTAL	9,230	100%

Source: California Department of Finance, 2020, Population and Housing Estimates.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The City's one mobile home park contains 210 units, indicating the Census counted 20 additional units in the "other" category which could be reflective of second units or guesthouses if they are occupied as someone's current place of residence.

#### A. RENTAL MARKET AND AFFORDABILITY

While Calabasas is predominately an ownership community, the percentage of renter households has increased over the last 20 years. In 2000, just 19 percent of households in the City were renters. In 2020, renter households had increased to 32 percent, reflective of several new multi-family rental complexes developed in the City in recent years, as well as condominiums and single-family homes that are being used as rentals.

Calabasas is home to six apartment complexes – Malibu Canyon Apartments (698 units), Avalon Bay (previously Archstone - 600 units), Malibu Creek Apartments (44 units), Horizons at Calabasas (60 units – age restricted 55+), Canyon Creek Apartments (75 units – rent restricted), and the new Paxton Calabasas Townhomes (78 units).

Table 10 shows the results of a June 2020 rent survey that was conducted on vacant units in the five market-rate apartment complexes (Canyon Creek Apartments was not included as rents are restricted to low income levels). Rent levels in Malibu Canyon, Avalon Calabasas and Malibu Creek Apartments generally average \$2,028 to \$2,179 for a one-bedroom, \$2,445 to \$2,771 for a two-bedroom and \$3,063 for a three-bedroom unit. Rents at the Horizons at Calabasas are slightly higher than these averages and are also age restricted to residents 55 years and older. The new luxury Paxton Townhomes have rents that are significantly higher than the other properties, due to the large sizes of the units and range of amenities that are offered. The Paxton complex includes four very-low-income units in compliance with the City's inclusionary housing ordinance.

Table 10: Rental Rates June 2020

Apartment Name	Unit Type	Monthly Rent for Vacant Units	Average Rent for Vacant Units
Malibu Canyon Apartments	1 bdrm <i>(17 units)</i>	\$1,888 - \$2,135	\$2,028
5757 Las Virgenes Rd (698 Total Units)	2 bdrm (31 units)	\$2,207 - \$2,720	\$2,445
	3 bdrm (6 units)	\$2,968 - \$3,168	\$3,063
Avalon Bay (formerly Archstone)	1 bdrm (19 units)	\$2,024 - \$2,345	\$2,179
3831 N. Orchid Lane (600 Total Units)	2 bdrm (23 units)	\$2,483 - \$3,171	\$2,771
Paxton Calabasas Townhomes	2 bdrm (2 units)	\$5,355	\$5,355
Paxton Place (78 Total Units)	3 bdrm (10 units)	\$4,995 - \$6,425	\$5,655
Horizons at Calabasas (age 55+)	1 bdrm (1 unit)	\$3,213	\$3,213
26705 Malibu Hills Rd (60 Total Units)	2 bdrm (2 units)	\$3,390 - \$3,490	\$3,440
Malibu Creek Apts 5320 Las Virgenes Rd (44 Total Units)	2 bdrm <i>(1 unit)</i>	\$2,550	\$2,550

Source: Rental Survey conducted by Karen Warner Associates, June 2020.

Table 11 presents the maximum affordable rents in 2020 for very low, low and moderate income households by household size, and compares them with the 2020 average apartment rents for Malibu Canyon, Avalon Calabasas and Malibu Creek Apartments from Table 10. As indicated, average rents are well above the level of affordability for very low, low and even moderate income households. The affordability gap for two-bedroom units is \$1,467 for very low income households, \$707 for low income households and \$647 for moderate income households.

Table 11: 2020 Maximum Affordable Rents\* for Los Angeles County

rable in 2020 maximum randi addio itomo ioi 200 rangolos obanty					
Income Level**	1 Bedroom (2 person)	2 Bedroom (3 person)	3 Bedroom (4 person)		
Very Low Income	\$999	\$1,122	\$1,236		
Low Income	\$1,676	\$1,882	\$2,081		
Moderate Income	\$1,728	\$1,942	\$2,147		
Calabasas Average Rents***	\$2,104	\$2,589	\$3,063		

Source: Karen Warner Associates, 2020.

Paxton Townhomes and Horizons at Calabasas) from Table 10.

#### **Rental Vacancy**

The vacancy rate measures the overall housing availability in a community and is often a good indicator of how efficiently for-sale and rental housing units are meeting the current demand for housing. A vacancy rate of five percent for rental housing suggests that there is a balance between the supply and demand of housing, whereas vacancies well below this level may indicate that households are having difficulty finding available housing, which can lead to high competition for units and upward pressure on rents. The 2014-2018 American Community Survey measures a rental vacancy rate of four percent in Calabasas, indicating a less than optimal supply of vacant rental units for normal mobility.

#### Calabasas Village Mobile Estates

Calabasas Village Mobile Estates located on Mulholland Highway contains 210 mobile home spaces. Approximately one-third (60-70 households) of park occupants are senior citizens. The City's General Plan established a mobile home park land use designation and the City's Development Code now has a mobile home park zoning district. These designations help to preserve the property for long term mobile home park use. The Housing Element includes a program for continued preservation of the mobile home park, including providing information on the State's Mobile Home Park Rehabilitation and Resident Ownership Program (MPROP).

While historically the park has served as a source of relatively affordable housing, increases in space rents have rendered it less affordable to lower income tenants. The July 2019 space rents at the mobile home park were identified as \$1,577,3 a monthly

<sup>\*</sup> Maximum rent reflects deduction of utility allowance per LACDC 2020 utility schedule:

<sup>\$127</sup> for 1 bedrooms, \$146 for 2 bedrooms, and \$172 for 3 bedrooms.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Income levels reflect the 2020 Official State Income Limits published by State HCD.

<sup>\*\*\*</sup>Calabasas Average Rents are from market rate apartment complexes (excluding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Calabasas Rental Registration Program, February 2020.

increase of \$134 (9.4% increase) from July 2018. In addition to space rents, some occupants may also have monthly mortgage payments on their mobile home coach.

In response to escalating rents, in January 2004, the City initiated a Rental Assistance Program for lower income tenants in the park, providing for a monthly subsidy for incomequalified tenants. The program has subsequently been expanded to include lower income seniors and disabled residents in the City's apartment complexes also impacted by rent increases. In December 2010, the City Council made the Rental Assistance Program permanent, expanding its capacity to 50 households and increasing monthly subsidy levels which are increased annually based on the Consumer Price Index. As of October 2020, this program was providing assistance to 50 households with 42 of these households residing in the mobile home park. The subsidy in 2020 was \$250 a month.

#### **Accessory Dwelling Units**

Accessory dwelling units (ADU), also referred to as granny flats and secondary units, provide an affordable housing option and are seen as an important tool to help meet the housing needs in communities. The State enacted legislation in both 2017 and 2019 to further assist and support the development of ADUs, including "by right" approval for one-bedroom units less than 850 square feet and two-bedroom units less than 1,000 square feet. In January 2020, the City Council adopted an ordinance amending the City's Development Code to comply with the latest State laws governing ADUs and Junior ADUs. The City's ADU ordinance allows for units up to 1,200 square feet, or up to 50% the living area of the primary unit.

Calabasas recognizes that ADUs can provide housing opportunities for lower and moderate income households, including seniors and caregivers. The following describes recent activity related to ADUs in the City:

- ➤ Between the years 2014-2020, a total of 22 building permits were issued by the City for ADUs. In the first year since adoption of the City's updated ordinance (Jan-Dec 2020), the City has seen a dramatic increase in ADUs, with seven units approved and another nine units in process. These numbers well exceed the goal of 12 units set out in the previous Housing Element.
- ➤ In 2019, the City Council adopted a resolution expanding the City's Home Repair Program to include loans for the development of ADUs. Funds in the amount of \$500,000 from the Affordable Housing Fund were designated for the program. The first \$50,000 loan was issued in 2020 to assist a senior citizen homeowner convert an existing garage into an ADU.
- ➤ The updated Housing Element incudes a program for the City to incentivize and promote ADUs, including the creation of architectural prototypes.

**ADU Affordability:** In December 2020, the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) released a "Regional Accessory Dwelling Unit Affordability Analysis." SCAG conducted this analysis to "provide local governments in the region with assumptions for ADU affordability that can be used to assign ADUs to income

CITY of CALABASAS 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Southern California Association of Governments, "SCAG Regional Accessory Dwelling Unit Affordability Analysis", December 2020.

categories for the purpose of Sixth Cycle Housing Elements." The analysis consisted of five steps:

- A. Calculate maximum rent limits for RHNA income categories for both one-person and two-person households by county;
- B. Conduct a rent survey for ADUs in the SCAG region (a total of 150 existing ADUS were surveyed between April and June 2020);
- C. Use regional survey to determine proportion of ADUs within each income category for both one-person and two-person households;
- D. Make assumptions for what percentage of ADUs will be occupied by one-person and two-person households;
- E. Use (D) to combine proportions from (C) into single breakdown of rented ADUs by income category.

The steps above apply to rented ADUs. However, one prevalent use of ADUs is for family members or others (such as caretakers) who are not charged rent. SCAG looked at other surveys and resources to determine the percentage of ADUs where people live rent free. Based on this review, SCAG estimated that 15% of ADUs are provided rent-free, and can therefore be assumed to be affordable to extremely low income households (0-30% AMI).

In order to account for differences in housing costs, the SCAG geography was divided into five subregions, including Los Angeles County which was divided into two areas – the coastal jurisdictions and the inland jurisdictions. Table 12 presents SCAG's affordability assumptions for ADUs in LA County's coastal jurisdictions, which includes the Las Virgenes subregion, providing the basis for assigning affordability to projected ADUs in Calabasas' Housing Element Update. As shown, 60 percent of all ADUs and 45 percent of rented ADUs are estimated by SCAG to be affordable to lower income households.

Table 12: Affordability Assumptions for ADUs

Category	Affordability Assumptions for Rented ADUs <sup>1</sup> (85% of Total)	Affordability Assumptions for Non-Rented ADUs <sup>2</sup> (15% of Total)	Affordability Assumption for all ADUs <sup>3</sup> (100% of Total)
Extremely Low Income	0%	100%	15%
Very Low Income	3%	0%	2%
Low Income	51%	0%	43%
Moderate Income	7%	0%	6%
Above Moderate Income	40%	0%	34%

Source: SCAG Regional Accessory Dwelling Unit Affordability Analysis, December 2020.

<sup>1.</sup> Used step D in analysis to combine proportions from step  $\bar{C}$  into single breakdown of rented ADUs by income category.

<sup>2.</sup> Based on SCAG research of non-rented ADUs, it was determined that 15% of ADUS will be available at rents affordable to Extremely Low Income households.

<sup>3.</sup> Combined by multiplying rented ADUs by 85% and non-rented ADUs by 15%.

#### B. HOMEOWNER MARKET AND AFFORDABILITY

#### **Housing Values**

The real estate website Zillow.com has developed a home valuation model to estimate the market value of individual properties, and compiles this information to produce a median "Home Value Index" for any given geographic area. Table 13 presents the December 2019 median home value index for Calabasas and nearby communities, and shows the change in median home values from 2018.

Housing prices in Calabasas and the surrounding areas increased dramatically over the last decade. In 2010, Zillow identified the City's home value index at \$856,500 (inclusive of both single-family homes and condominiums), whereas in 2019, the value index had increased to \$1,235,500. As shown in Table 13, home values generally increased between one and three percent between 2018-2019, with the exception of Topanga, which had a loss of around three percent. Home values in the area are well above the County as a whole (\$679,400 in December 2019).

**Table 13: Regional Home Values 2019** 

Community	Zip Code	December 2019 Median Home Value Index	% Change from December 2018
Agoura Hills	91301	\$883,000	1.0%
Calabasas	91302	\$1,235,500	0.4%
Malibu	90265	\$3,105,800	3.3%
Topanga	90290	\$1,286,400	-3.0%
Thousand Oaks	91360	\$722,300	2.3%
Triousariu Oaks	91362	\$846,600	1.4%
Westlake Village	91361	\$1.068,200	1.2%
LA, Long Beach, Anaheim Metro Area	all	\$679,400	1.6%

Source: Zillow Home Value Index from Zillow.com, Data through December 31, 2019; LA County Area includes Los Angeles-Long Beach-Anaheim Metro Area.

Table 14 provides a further break down of housing values in Calabasas by number of bedrooms, and compares with home values throughout Los Angeles County. As shown, median home values for two-bedroom units in Calabasas are fairly comparable to values County-wide, whereas as unit size increases, the difference in values widens significantly.

**Table 14: Median Home Values by Unit Size** 

Number of Bedrooms	December 2018 Value	December 2019 Value	% Change	Los Angeles County 2019*
2	\$537,700	\$548,200	2.0%	\$547,400
3	\$906,400	\$922,400	1.8%	\$646,100
4	\$1,233,700	\$1,238,300	0.4%	\$794,700
5+	\$2,197,800	\$2,158,400	-1.8%	\$1,171,000
Total	\$1,231,100	\$1,235,500	0.4%	\$679,400

Source: Zillow Home Value Index from Zillow.com, Data through December 31, 2019. \*LA County Area includes Los Angeles-Long Beach-Anaheim Metro Area.

Another important data set is the sales listing price for homes on the market. In December 2019, Calabasas' median list price was \$502 per square foot, while the list price in the greater LA/Orange County metro area was \$444 per square foot. In June 2020, 60 homes and 11 townhomes were for sale in Calabasas on Zillow listing services. The price ranges are included below. It is important to note that nearly half of the single-family homes listed had five or more bedrooms, while only one of the listings was for a two-bedroom home.

#### Single-family home listings

- o 60 homes total
- o One (1) two-bedroom home was listed at \$1,500,000
- Fifteen three-bedroom homes ranged from \$915,000 to 1,199,000
- Eighteen four-bedroom homes were listed, ranging from \$915,000 to \$2,779,000, with one home listed at \$4,900,000
- 26 five- and six-bedroom homes were listed, ranging between \$1,499,000 and 4,599,000, with one six-bedroom home listed at over ten million dollars

#### Townhome/Condo listings

- 11 listings in total
- One one-bedroom unit was listed at \$389,950
- Six two-bedroom townhomes/condos were listed between \$549,000 and \$655,000. One listing was \$1,649,000
- Three three-bedrooms were listed between \$600,000 and \$749,999

#### **Homeowner Affordability**

The affordability of housing in Calabasas can be assessed by comparing market sales prices with the amount that households of different income levels can afford to pay for housing. Compared together, this information can reveal who can afford what size and type of housing as well as indicate the type of households that would most likely experience overcrowding or overpayment.

Table 15 presents the maximum affordable purchase price for moderate income households (120% AMI), and compares this with median home values as previously documented in Table 14. As illustrated below, the maximum affordable purchase price ranges from \$444,276 for a three-person household, \$533,632 for a four-person household, and \$545,881 for a five-person household, rendering home prices in Calabasas well beyond the reach of moderate income households.

Table 15: 2020 Los Angeles County Maximum Affordable Housing Cost

Moderate Income Affordable Housing Cost	2 Bedroom (3 Persons)	3 Bedroom (4 persons)	4 Bedroom (5 persons)
Household Income @ 120% Median	\$83,500	\$92,750	\$101,500
Income Towards Housing @ 35% Income	\$29,225	\$34,462	\$35,525
Maximum Monthly Housing Cost	\$2,435	\$2,871	\$2,960
Less Expenses:			
Utilities <sup>1</sup>	(\$146)	(\$172)	(\$204)
Taxes (1.10% of sales price)	(\$406)	(\$488)	(\$500)
Homeowner Insurance (0.10% of sales price) <sup>2</sup>	(\$37)	(\$44)	(\$45)
HOA Fees & Other Maintenance	(\$250)	(\$250)	(\$250)
Monthly Income Available for Mortgage	\$1,596	\$1,917	\$1,961
Supportable Mortgage @ 3.5% interest	\$355,421	\$426,906	\$436,705
Homebuyer Downpayment (20%)	\$88,855	\$106,726	\$109,176
Maximum Affordable Purchase Price	\$444,276	\$533,632	\$545,881
Calabasas Median Home Value	\$548,200	\$922,400	\$1,238,300

Source: Karen Warner Associates.

- 1. Utility costs based on 2020 HACoLA schedule and assumes gas appliances.
- 2. Estimated from quotes from Progressive Insurance
- 3. Median home prices (inclusive of both single-family and condominiums) based on Zillow Home Value Index from Zillow.com, Data through December 2019.

A vacancy rate of two percent for ownership housing is generally considered healthy. A low vacancy rate is an indicator of a particularly 'tight' housing market, which may lead to high competition for homes, raising housing prices. According to the 2014-2018 American Community Survey, the homeowner vacancy rate in Calabasas is 0.6 percent, indicating less than ideal vacancies and a pent-up demand for housing.

#### C. HOUSING PROBLEMS

A continuing priority of communities is enhancing or maintaining the quality of life for residents. A key measure of the quality of life in Calabasas is the extent of "housing problems," including housing overpayment and overcrowding.

#### Overpayment

Overpayment remains a critical issue for low and moderate-income households, who are disproportionately affected by this burden compared to other households. Affordability problems occur when housing costs become so high in relation to income that households have to pay an excessive proportion of their income for housing. Housing overpayment, as defined by the State and Federal government, occurs when a household spends more than 30 percent of its income on total housing costs, inclusive of rent/mortgage payments, utility costs, insurance, and any HOA fees; severe overpayment refers to spending greater than 50 percent of income on total housing costs. Table 16 shows the incidence of overpayment in Calabasas.

Table 16: Housing Overpayment 2018

Overpayment	Households	Percent	L.A. Co. (%)
Renters			
Overpayment			
(30%-50% income on housing)	575	21%	25%
Severe Overpayment			
(>50% income on housing)	1,089	41%	29%
Owners			
Overpayment			
(>30% income on housing)	2,176	47%	44%

Source: SCAG Pre-Certified Local Housing Data, August 2020.

Household count differs from 2020 Dept of Finance count depicted in Table 6.

The 2014-18 American Community Survey data compiled by SCAG identifies 21 percent (575 households) of renters in Calabasas as spending between 30 and 50 percent of their total income on housing, with an additional 41 percent spending more than half their income on housing. While total renter overpayment is fairly consistent with levels measured in the 2010 Census, severe overpayment increased substantially from 24 to 41 percent, and is well above the 29 percent severe overpayment Countywide. Among owner households, 47 percent (2,176) were overpaying, consistent with overpayment levels measured in the 2010 Census.

Among lower income renter households, overpayment is most pronounced. As shown in Table 17, all renter households earning less than \$20,000 in Calabasas face severe overpayment and all renter households earning less than \$50,000 face either overpayment or severe overpayment. As anticipated, as a household's income increases, the level of overpayment declines. The impact of housing overpayment on Calabasas' lower income households is significant, with the community's special needs populations – seniors, persons with disabilities, and female-headed households with children - most vulnerable to losing their housing due to an inability to pay. The high incidence of renter overpayment represents a significant housing need in Calabasas, and is addressed

through Housing Element programs for: Rental Assistance; Accessory Dwelling Units; Inclusionary Housing; and Affordable Housing Development Assistance.

**Table 17: Lower Income Renter Overpayment 2018** 

	Overpayment (30-50% income on housing)		Severe Overpayment (>50% income on housing)		
Income Level	% of renter income category		Households	% of renter income category	
Less than \$20,000	0	0%	350	100%	
\$20,000-\$34,999	32	13%	217	87%	
\$35,000 to \$49,999	67	20%	275	80%	
\$50,000 to \$74,999	208	45%	223	48%	
\$75,000 to \$99,999	65	31%	14	7%	
\$100,000 or more	203	19%	10	1%	

Source: SCAG Pre-Certified Local Housing Data, August 2020.

Household count differs from 2020 Dept of Finance count depicted in Table 6.

#### Overcrowding

The State defines an overcrowded housing unit as one occupied by more than 1.01 persons per room (excluding kitchens, porches, and hallways). A unit with more than 1.51 occupants per room is considered severely overcrowded. The incidence of overcrowded housing is a general measure of whether there is an available supply of adequately sized housing units.

Table 18 shows the incidence of overcrowding in Calabasas and Los Angeles County as measured by the 2014-2018 American Community Survey compiled by SCAG. As indicated, less than three percent renters and less than one percent of owners in Calabasas have been identified as overcrowded (either overcrowded or severe overcrowded), in sharp contrast to the 16 percent of renters and six percent of owners identified Countywide as living in overcrowded conditions. In summary, household overcrowding is not a significant housing issue in the community.

Table 18: Overcrowded Households 2018

Overcrowding	Households	Percent	L.A. Co. (%)
Renters			
Overcrowding (1-1.5 ppl/room)	47	1.6%	9%
Severe Overcrowding (>1.5 ppl/room)	33	1.2%	7%
Owners			
Overcrowding (1-1.5 ppl/room)	10	0.2%	4%
Severe Overcrowding (>1.5 ppl/room)	0	0%	2%

Source: SCAG Pre-Certified Local Housing Data, August 2020.

Household count differs from 2020 Dept of Finance count depicted in Table 6.

#### D. HOUSING ADEQUACY

The vast majority of housing in Calabasas is in excellent condition. Throughout the community, homes are well maintained and evidence continued investment and upgrading. As presented in the prior section, less than three percent of rental housing in Calabasas is considered overcrowded, compared to 12 percent renter overcrowding Countywide. The high rate of owner-occupied units and relatively high household incomes contribute to the high quality of the housing stock in Calabasas.

The age of a community's housing stock can also provide an indicator of overall housing conditions. Typically housing over 30 years in age is likely to have rehabilitation needs that may include new plumbing, roof repairs, foundation work and other repairs. Table 19 displays the age of Calabasas' occupied housing stock as of 2020. With 73 percent of Calabasas' housing stock built prior to 1989, almost 6,500 units have reached the 30-year benchmark. Homes in the City's older neighborhoods were predominately built in the 1960s, 1970s and 1980s, and are now approaching the age at which more significant improvements become necessary, such as new plumbing or roofing. The aging of such a large portion of the Calabasas' housing stock indicates a need for code enforcement, property maintenance and housing rehabilitation programs. While no units have been identified as needing replacement, an estimated 20 percent of the pre-1989 housing stock (approximately 1,300 units) may be in need of some level of rehabilitation.

**Table 19: Age of Housing Stock** 

V 5 "	Renter Occupied	Percent	Owner Occupied	Percent	Total
Year Built	Housing	Renter	Housing	Owner	Percent
2014 or later	17	<1%	61	1%	1%
2010-2013	34	1%	21	<1%	1%
2000-2009	114	4%	576	10%	8%
1990-1999	679	24%	919	15%	18%
1980-1989	1,104	39%	2,213	37%	37%
1970-1979	462	16%	1,019	17%	16%
1960-1969	391	14%	1,010	16%	16%
1950-1959	43	1%	146	2%	2%
1940-1949	0	0%	60	1%	<1%
1939 or earlier	10	<1%	39	<1%	<1%
Total	2,854	100%	6,064	100%	100%

Source: ACS 2014-2018; Dept of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates.

The City's Residential Rehabilitation Program provides loan and grant assistance to lower income households to make needed repairs, with the majority of households taking advantage of this program either mobile home park residents and/or senior citizens. Between 2014 and 2019, the City provided rehabilitation assistance to 33 lower income households. The City also offers a locally-funded Home Repair Program to assist low and moderate income property owners of severely dilapidated properties cited for code violations to make needed repairs to make the units safe and habitable.

#### E. SENIOR HOUSING NEEDS

As illustrated in Table 20 below, 17 percent of Calabasas' population were age 65 and above in 2020, with another 15 percent ("pre-seniors") turning this age over the coming decade. One-quarter of the City's households are headed by a senior, with the vast majority (86%) being owner households. Over 20 percent of elderly residents in Calabasas have some type of disability, which may limit their ability to live independently.

**Table 20: Characteristics of Senior Population 2020** 

Population/ Household Category	Persons	Households	Percent
Seniors (65+)	4,064		17%
With a Disability	882		(22%)
Senior Households		2,265	25%
Renter		324	(14%)
Owner		1,941	(86%)
Senior Homeowners Living Alone		509	(26%)

Source: ACS 2014-2018; Dept. of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates.

Of Calabasas' approximately 2,265 senior homeowners, one-quarter live alone. As these homeowners age, many may be unable to maintain their homes or perform minor repairs.

Given Calabasas' growing senior population, the City will continue to experience increases in the need for senior housing and services. Particularly those seniors age 75 and above begin to require housing with a supportive services component. Rising apartment and mobile home park rents, as well as ongoing homeowner maintenance costs are a particular concern for seniors, as many are on fixed incomes. The Calabasas Senior Center, which opened in 2016, is a gathering place for seniors that offers activities, classes, excursions and special luncheons and dinners. A broad range of support services are offered, including housing referrals to independent senior living, assisted living, board & care, and memory care facilities.

Calabasas has several specialized residential facilities for seniors, including:

- Silverado Senior Living a 110-bed facility for persons with Alzheimer's Disease and related dementias
- ➤ Horizons 55 Senior Housing provides 60 luxury rental units for seniors
- Canyon Creek provides 75 rental units affordable to lower income seniors
- Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments 42 unit senior housing units, including five very low income units, coming on line in early 2022
- Belmont Village Senior Living (located just outside the city in Craftsman Corner) a new 165-bed facility that offers assisted living and memory care options

#### F. WORKFORCE HOUSING NEEDS

Calabasas is considered "jobs rich", with approximately 2.2 jobs for every housing unit. As presented in the earlier section on Employment, over 90 percent of persons employed in Calabasas commute in from outside the City, indicative of the shortage of local affordable housing opportunities for the community's workforce. Recognizing this need, in 1998 the City commissioned a *Commercial/Industrial Development and Affordable Housing Nexus Study,* and subsequently established an affordable housing impact fee on commercial and industrial development. While somewhat dated, the 1998 study provides valuable insight on the housing needs generated by the community's workforce. For example, the study estimated that 40 percent of recent workers in Calabasas were low-to-moderate income, and over half these workers commute over 30 miles daily. Furthermore, the study indicated that 17 percent of recent employees attempted to find housing in Calabasas, and that less than a quarter of these were successful, citing high housing costs and lack of residential vacancies as major deterrents.

The limited supply of rentals in Calabasas, combined with escalating rents averaging \$2,600 for a two-bedroom unit, has pushed rental housing out of reach for even moderate (120% AMI) income occupations.<sup>5</sup> And with for-sale housing prices averaging around \$900,000 to well over a million dollars, homeownership within the City is unattainable for most of Calabasas' working professionals, including:

- Teachers
- Civic Employees
- Police Officers
- > Firefighters
- > Engineers

Employers are increasingly recognizing that recruitment and retention of employees is dependent upon the availability of local affordable housing options. With the majority of the local workforce commuting long distances, affordable housing opportunities near jobs are not only needed to assist the City in addressing workforce housing needs, but also to achieve General Plan goals for reduced vehicle trips and improved air quality. The Calabasas 2030 General Plan established a mixed- use land use category and designated three areas for transition to mixed use, providing expanded opportunities for multi-family, workforce housing.

CITY of CALABASAS 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Based on an income-to-housing cost ratio of 30%, a household needs to earn at least \$104,000 per year to afford a monthly rent of \$2,600. The 2020 moderate-income (120% AMI) threshold for Los Angeles County for a single-person household is \$64,900 and \$74,200 for a two-person household, well below this level.

#### G. OTHER SPECIAL NEEDS GROUPS

State law recognizes that certain households have more difficulty in finding decent and affordable housing due to special circumstances including, but not limited to the following: economic status, age, disability, household size and household type. In addition to seniors described in the earlier section, other groups with special housing needs include persons with disabilities, female-headed households, large households and the homeless.

**Table 21: Special Needs Households 2010** 

Special Needs Groups		Persons	Households	Percent*
Persons Living with Disabiliti	ies*	1,790		7%
Female-Headed Family House	eholds*		1,034	12%
With children			590	(57%)
Large Households			565	6%
Renter			209	(37%)
Owner			356	(63%)

Source: ACS 2014-2018; Dept. of Finance 2020 Population and Housing Estimates. Note: Numbers in () reflect the % of the special needs group, and not the % of the total City population/households. For example, of the City's large households, 37% are renters and 63% are owners.

#### **Persons with Disabilities**

A disability is defined as a long-lasting condition (more than six months) that impairs an individual's mobility, ability to work, or ability to care for themselves. Persons with disabilities include those with physical, mental, or emotional disabilities. Disabled persons have special housing needs because of their fixed income, shortage of affordable and accessible housing, and higher health costs associated with their disability.

The 2014-2018 American Community Survey (ACS) identifies 1,790 Calabasas residents over the age of five as having one or more disabilities, representing seven percent of the City's population. Over forty percent of these residents are unable to live independently. The ACS documents the presence of following types of disabilities among Calabasas' disabled residents:

- Cognitive 38%
- ➤ Ambulatory 61%
- ➤ Hearing 29%
- ➤ Vision 17%

Of the City's senior population, 22 percent suffer from a disability. As Calabasas' population continues to age, the number of residents with disabilities will also increase.

Efforts to support the disabled in Calabasas include a Meals-on-Wheels program that delivers meals to individuals who are temporarily or permanently disabled. The City's Diala-Ride service also provides transportation around the Calabasas area to seniors over 55 years and to the disabled. Silverado Senior Living provides housing for 110 seniors with Alzheimer's and other dementias, and also includes an adult day care facility with capacity

for 30 persons. Belmont Village Senior Living is a new 165-bed facility that offers assisted living and memory care options for its residents.

The living arrangements for persons with disabilities depends on the severity of the disability. Many persons live at home in an independent environment with the help of other family members. To maintain independent living, disabled persons may require assistance. This can include special housing design features for the physically disabled, income support for those who are unable to work, and in-home supportive services for persons with medical conditions.

**Developmental Disabilities:** Due to the dramatic rise in autism spectrum disorders (ASD), in 2010 the California legislature passed SB 812 which requires the Housing Element to specifically analyze the housing needs of persons with developmental disabilities, and to identify resources available to serve this population. ASDs are the fastest growing developmental disability in California, and the state is projected to face a substantial number of persons with ASD maturing into adulthood, many of whom will want to live independently and need appropriate housing.

The Department of Developmental Services (DDS) provides community-based services to approximately 250,000 persons with developmental disabilities and their families through a statewide system of 21 regional centers, four developmental centers, and two community-based facilities. The goal of these centers is to: 1) prevent/minimize institutionalization of developmentally disabled persons and their dislocation from family and community; and 2) enable this population to lead more independent and productive lives.

The North Los Angeles County Regional Center (NLACRC) serves the San Fernando, Santa Clarita and Antelope Valleys. The NLACRC serves over 28,000 individuals with developmental disabilities and their families. Within zip code 91302, which encompasses greater Calabasas, the Regional Center currently provides services to 159 residents with developmental disabilities, including 103 persons under the age of 18, and 56 persons 18 years of age and older. Among these residents, 97.5 percent (155 persons) live with a parent, family member or guardian, with the remaining 2.5 percent living in a foster/group home or an independent/supportive living program.<sup>6</sup> These percentages highlight the need for people with developmentally disabled family members to have a variety of housing options to provide ongoing care and support.

The regional centers have identified a number of community-based housing types appropriate for persons living with a developmental disability: licensed community care facilities and group homes; supervised apartment settings with support services; SB 962 homes (for persons with special health care and intensive support needs); and for persons able to live more independently, rent subsidized housing.

Calabasas supports the provision of housing for persons with disabilities, and has adopted provisions in its Zoning Code to enable community care facilities and supportive housing and ensure reasonable accommodation. Housing Element programs to facilitate affordable housing - including Inclusionary Zoning, Affordable Housing Fund, Affordable Housing Development Assistance, and Density Bonus Incentives – can also assist

CITY of CALABASAS 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> California Department of Developmental Services, Consumer County by California ZIP Code and Residence Type. Regional Center and Early Start Consumers, June 2020.

residents with developmental disabilities. The expansion of the City's Home Repair Program to include loans for the development of accessory dwelling units may provide another housing option.

#### Female-Headed Family Households

The 2014-2018 American Community Survey identifies 1,034 female-headed family households (no husband present) in Calabasas, comprising twelve percent of total households. Of these female-headed households, over half (57%) have children, and of those with children, fifteen percent experience poverty. Many of these households need assistance with housing subsidies, as well as accessible and affordable day care.

The Calabasas Community Tennis and Swim Center offers a variety of youth programs that can help supplement day care. Children and teens can participate in a variety of fitness activities and intramural sports leagues, arts and dance classes, after-school programs, and special camps and excursions. The Agoura Hills/Calabasas Community Center is also available for use by the City's young residents. This state-of-the-art recreational facility offers discounted memberships for students as well as a unique Child Watch Program that provides daycare for parents using the Community Center's facilities

#### Large Households

In Calabasas, large households with five or more members comprise six percent of the City's total households. Of the City's 565 large households, 37 percent (209 households) are renters. This percentage has increased since 2010, when less than 20 percent (143 households) of large households were renters. The 2014-2018 American Community Survey documents 960 rental units in Calabasas with 3 or more bedrooms, in general, the appropriate size for households with 5-6 members, indicating a more than adequate supply of units for the City's large renter households. However, given that the average rents for a three-bedroom apartment is over \$3,000, affordable housing options may be limited. In contrast to many communities where a significant segment of large households may be lower income renters, the majority of Calabasas' large households are families who own their own homes and have relatively high incomes.

#### Homeless

Due to the relative inaccessibility and distance from urban centers, Calabasas does not attract many homeless individuals or families. The 2020 Greater Los Angeles Homeless Count, conducted by the Los Angeles Homeless Service Authority (LAHSA), included a count of homeless on the street, in shelters (emergency, transitional and safe haven), hidden homeless and youth. This count was done across the County on a single night in January 2020. Within Calabasas, the 2020 count identified two homeless (both unsheltered on the night of the PIT Count).<sup>7</sup>

LAHSA disperses funds to the eight Service Planning Areas (SPAs) in the County for coordinated responses to homeless issues (Calabasas is located in SPA 2). Los Angeles Family Housing, located in North Hollywood, provides services for SPA 2 including: outreach, housing placement assistance and a variety of supportive services.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority, 2020 Greater Los Angeles Homeless County, 2020.

CITY of CALABASAS

BACKGROUND REPORT

In Calabasas, the homeless tend to be transient in nature rather than a long-term resident population (i.e., encampments) and are most often located in parks, public spaces, and undeveloped open space, both privately and publicly owned. When a homeless person is encountered, staff visits the individual and outreach materials and service information are provided. This is done by either the City's public safety staff or the homeless outreach coordinator for the Las Virgenes/Malibu Council of Governments (COG). Follow up visits are carried out by the COG coordinator to see if the individuals can access the services needed. Members of the public are also able to use the City's website to notify City staff of the presence of homeless individuals. The City's program provides homeless outreach and assistance in a timely and efficient manner.

#### **Farmworkers**

Farmworkers are traditionally defined as persons whose primary incomes are earned through seasonal agricultural work. In many parts of southern California, agriculture production is an important contribution to local economies. The City of Calabasas has no agricultural land in active production nor do the adjacent cities of Westlake Village or Agoura Hills. According to SCAG's 2020 Housing Element dataset, none of the persons working in Calabasas are employed in farming occupations.

#### H. Assisted Housing At Risk of Conversion

State Housing Element law requires an analysis of the potential for currently rent-restricted low income housing units to convert to market rate housing, and to propose programs to preserve or replace any units "at-risk" of conversion. This section presents information on recent conversions of affordable housing in Calabasas as well as analysis of the current three assisted rental projects, and evaluates those units at risk of conversion during the nine year, 2013-2023 planning period.

#### 2014-2021 Planning Period

The City had identified 140 affordable units at Malibu Canyon at risk of going to market rate because the associated bonds were set to expire in 2016. Subsequently, the City was informed in 2017 of Avalon Bay's (formerly Archstone Calabasas) intent to pay off their 2028 bond early, putting an additional 120 affordable units at risk of conversion. The City followed the steps outlined in the Housing Element program to work towards preservation, but was unsuccessful in both cases. Discussions with both the Los Angeles Community Development Commission (CDC) and California Housing Partnership (CHPC) informed the City that without significant financial resources, options to preserve these bond projects were quite limited.

The City undertook the following steps identified in the Housing Element to preserve the at-risk units:

- Conducted an economic analysis to determine the cost of buying down the rents which proved too costly as it would exhaust City's Affordable Housing Trust Fund in just two years.
- ➤ Staff researched outside funding opportunities, including from LA County, but was unable to identify adequate funds for long-term preservation. Because ownership of Avalon Bay is a Real Estate Investment Trust (REIT), they were unable to use tax credits to extend affordability commitments.
- ➤ Met with both property owners to discuss options for preservation. Malibu Canyon was not interested in preservation, but Avalon Bay subsequently submitted an initiative to construct 161 new apartments on the site, in exchange for preservation of 80 of the original 120 affordable units. The initiative was not approved by the voters at the March 3, 2020 election.
- City staff has been available to provide assistance to each tenant explaining their rights and conversion procedures, and has proactively updated the City's website to include resources for tenant rights and other affordable housing options within the City and the region.

Despite these actions, the program was not effective in preserving these affordable units.

#### 2021-2029 Planning Period

The City does not have any affordable housing at-risk of conversion during this planning period. Canyon Creek apartments was financed using tax credits, which extend through 2066. The Paxton Calabasas project, which includes four very low income units, has affordability controls which extend to 2048. Avanti includes eight units for very low income tenants, which has deed restrictions until 2046. And Calabasas Creekside, projected to open in mid-2022, includes five very low income units with affordability controls that extend through 2077. Details about these projects are included in Table 22 which follows.

Table 22: Assisted Rental Housing Inventory

Project Name	Tenant Type	Source of Assistance	Total Project Units	Affordable Units	Potential Conversion Date
Canyon Creek	Senior	City Housing	75	74 Low	2066
Apartments	(age 62+)	Trust Funds;		Income	
4803 El Canon Ave		Tax Credits			
Paxton Calabasas	Family	Inclusionary	74	4 Very Low	2048
4240 Las Virgenes		Ordinance		Income	
Avanti	Family	Inclusionary	80	8 Very Low	2046
23500 Park Sorrento		Ordinance;		Income	
		Density Bonus			
Calabasas	Senior	Inclusionary	42	5 Very Low	2077
Creekside	(age 55+)	Ordinance;		Income	
23480 Park Sorrento		Density Bonus			

Source: City of Calabasas, October 2020.

Any future affordable rental units provided through the City's inclusionary housing ordinance or subsidized through the Affordable Housing Fund would similarly carry long term affordability controls.

#### I. FUTURE HOUSING GROWTH NEEDS

The Regional Housing Allocation (RHNA) is a state-mandated process, which determines the amount of future housing growth each city and county must plan for in their housing elements. This "fair share" allocation concept seeks to ensure that each jurisdiction accepts responsibility for the housing needs of not only its resident population, but also for the jurisdiction's projected share of regional housing growth across all income categories. Regional growth needs are defined as the number of units that would have to be added in each jurisdiction to accommodate the forecasted number of households, as well as the number of units that need to be added to compensate for anticipated demolitions and changes to achieve an "ideal" vacancy rate.

The RHNA process begins with the California Department of Housing and Community Development's (HCD) projection of future statewide housing growth need, and the apportionment of this need to regional councils of government throughout the state. As southern California's designated Council of Government, the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) is the agency responsible for developing an allocation methodology to allocate the region's assigned share of statewide need to cities and counties by income level. The main determining factors in SCAG's methodology are: household growth (based on Connect SoCal growth forecast), job accessibility, and transit accessibility. After a RHNA total is calculated, a social equity adjustment is applied to determine the four income categories.

The process for the 6th cycle RHNA is underway, with 1.34 million new housing units assigned by the state to the SCAG region, representing the largest allocation the region has ever received and resulting in much higher RHNA allocations for SCAG cities and counties. At its September 3, 2020 meeting, SCAG's Regional Council adopted the 2020-2045 Regional Transportation Plan/Sustainable Communities Strategy (Connect SoCal) on which the RHNA is based. Draft RHNA allocations were then distributed to local jurisdictions, with the final RHNA allocation scheduled to be adopted by SCAG in February 2021. Table 23 presents Calabasas draft RHNA for the 2021-2029 Housing Element cycle.

Table 23: Regional Housing Needs Assessment 2021-2029

Income Level	Percent of AMI*	Units	Percent
Very Low**	0-50%	131	37%
Low	51-80%	71	20%
Moderate	81-120%	70	20%
Above Moderate	120%+	81	23%
Total		353	100%

Source: Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) 6th Cycle RHNA allocation based on final RHNA methodology & final Connect SoCal 9/3/20

<sup>\*</sup> AMI - Area Median Income

<sup>\*\*</sup> An estimated half of the City's 131 very low income housing needs (66 units) units are for extremely low income households earning less than 30% AMI.

## III. HOUSING CONSTRAINTS

This section assesses the various governmental, market, infrastructure and environmental factors that may serve as a potential constraint to housing development in Calabasas.

#### A. GOVERNMENTAL CONSTRAINTS

#### 1. Land Use Controls

The General Plan Land Use Element sets forth the City's policies for guiding local development, and establishes the amount and distribution of land to be allocated for different uses within the City. The General Plan land use categories provide for the following range of residential land use types in Calabasas.

**Table 24: Residential Land Use Districts** 

General Plan Land Use District	Zoning	Maximum Density	Primary Residential Type(s)	
Urban Residential and Mixed-Use				
Residential–Single Family (R-SF)	RS	6 du/acre (12 du/acre for senior projects)	Single-family detached housing units, including large lot estates, suburban tract developments, and small lot residences	
Residential-Multiple Family (R-MF12)	RM	12 du/acre	Attached apartments, condominiums, townhomes, visitor-serving uses, and duplexes	
Residential-Multiple Family (R-MF16)	RM	20 du/acre*	Attached apartments, condominiums, townhomes, visitor-serving uses, and duplexes	
Residential-Multiple Family (R-MF20)	RM	20 du/acre	Attached apartments, condominiums, townhomes, visitor-serving uses, and duplexes	
Residential-Mobile Home (R-MH)	RMH	8 du/acre	Mobile home parks	
Mixed Use (MU) MU 0.6 MU 0.95 MU 1.0	CMU	20 du/acre	Office, retail, and commercial services, and higher density residential uses. For MU 1.0, residential must constitute a min. 50% of overall floor area in each project.	
Planned Development	PD	60 units total	An area under common ownership intended for a mix of uses that warrants detailed planning due to unique features.	
Non-Urban Residen		<u> </u>		
Hillside Mountainous (HM)	НМ	1 du/10 acres or 1 du/existing lot	Single family detached housing in a very low intensity, rural setting	
Residential Rural (RR)	RR	1 du/acre or 1 du/existing lot	Single-family detached housing in a low intensity, rural setting	
Rural Community (RC)	RC	2 du/acre or 1 du/existing lot	Single family detached housing compatible with rural development patterns	

Source: Land Use Element, City of Calabasas General Plan, October 2015.

<sup>\*</sup> The General Plan RM-F 16 land use designation allows for 20 du/acre, which prevails over the zoning designation which allows for a max. 16 du/acre.

#### **Development Code**

The City regulates the type, location, density, and scale of residential development through the Development Code. Code regulations are designed to protect and promote the health, safety, and general welfare of residents as well as implement the policies of the General Plan. The Development Code also serves to ensure the continued quality of development in the community. The Code sets forth residential development standards for each zoning district, summarized in Table 25 and evaluated in the following section.

**Table 25: Residential Development Standards** 

_	Max.						
Zone District	Permitted Uses	Setbacks	Height	Lot Coverage	Density/ Intensity		
Urban Reside	Urban Residential						
Residential, Single-Family (RS)	Single-family hsg, ADUs, manufactured housing, small resid care homes, transitional & supportive housing	Front: 20' Side: 10' Street Side:15' Rear: 20'	35'	50% or 35% depending on lot size	Minimum: 2 du/acre Maximum: 6 du/acre		
Residential, Multifamily (RM)	Multi-family hsg, ADUs, manufactured housing, residential care homes, senior hsg, single-family hsg, transitional & supportive housing	Front: 20' Side: 10' Street Side:15' Rear: 20'	35'	55%	Minimum: 2 du/acre Maximum: 20 du/acre		
Residential, Mobile Home (RMH)	Mobile Homes, small residential care homes	Front: 30' Side: 10' Street Side:30' Rear: 10'	18' or 1 story, whichever is less	55%	8 mobile homes per acre		
Mixed Use (CMU)	Multi-family housing, senior housing, large residential care homes, office, retail, and entertainment uses	Front: none Side: none Street Side:10' Rear: none (20' if adj resid)	35' (2 stories hsg above comm'l)	62%	20 du/acre, 0.5 - 1.0 FAR (depending on location)		
Planned Development (PD)	Multi-family housing, senior housing, single- family housing, office, retail & restaurant uses	Determined by Development Plan Process	35'	Determined by Dev. Plan Process	60 mf dus/ project site, 150,000 sf commercial/ project site		
Non-Urban Residential							
Residential, Rural (RR)	Single-family housing, ADUs, manufactured housing, small residential care homes	Front: 30' Side: 10' Street Side:20' Rear: 20'	18' or 1 story, which- ever is less	30%	Minimum: 1 du/10 acre Maximum: 1 du/acre		
Rural Community (RC)*	Single-family housing, ADUs, manufactured housing, small residential care homes	Front: 30' Side: 10' Street Side:20' Rear: 20'	27' for pitched, 24' for parapet roof	35%	Minimum: 1 du/10 acre Maximum: 2 du/acre		

Source: City of Calabasas, Development Code, July 2020

<sup>\*</sup>Old Topanga and Calabasas Highlands setback standards supersede the underlying RC zone setbacks

Parking requirements are provided in Table 26 by residential uses. Multi-family parking requirements are fairly typical. To promote bicycle use and less reliance on the automobile for shorter trips, the City also imposes a minimum bicycle space requirement on multi-family units. This requirement is rather unique, but not overly burdensome to development.

In order to facilitate the provision of accessory dwelling units (ADUs), and consistent with State law, when a covered parking structure is demolished in conjunction with construction of an ADU, or is converted to an ADU, the required off-street parking for the primary unit is not required to be replaced. In addition, no additional parking is required for an ADU under any of the following circumstances: a) unit is located within one-half mile of a regularly scheduled public transit stop; b) unit is located within a City Council designated historic district; c) unit is part of the existing legal primary residence or an existing legal accessory structure; d) on-street preferential permits are required by the city but not offered to the occupant of the unit; or e) a publicly accessible car share vehicle parking facility is located within one block of the unit.

**Table 26: Parking Requirements** 

Residential Uses	Vehicle Spaces Required	Bicycle Spaces Required
Single-family home	2 spaces within a garage	None
Condominium, small lot single- family home	As required for multi-family housing. Each drive-way with minimum dimensions of 20 ft. by 20 ft. outside of a public right-of-way or private street may be counted as 1 guest parking space	1 space per unit
Accessory Dwelling Unit	1 space	None
Junior Accessory Dwelling Units	None	None
	Studio: 1 covered space per unit	
Multi-family, and senior (not assisted living or convalescent home)	1-bedroom unit: 1.5 spaces per units (1 covered)	1 space per unit
	2+ bedrooms: 2 spaces per unit, plus 0.5 additional spaces for each bedroom over 2. 1 of every 2 required spaces shall be covered	
	Guest Parking: 1 space per 3 units	1 space per 10 units
Senior Assisted Living/ Congregate Care	.5 spaces per unit; plus 1 space/employee of largest shift plus 1 space per regular visiting doctor, or as determined by a parking study.	5% of
Senior Convalescent Home/ Nursing Home	llescent 1 space for each 3 he	
Mobile Home Park	2 covered spaces (may be in tandem) per unit; plus guest parking as required for multi-family housing	None
Emergency Shelter	1 space for each 250 sq.ft. gross floor area	None

Source: City of Calabasas, Development Code (Chapter 17.28), July 2020.

Subsequent to the 2030 General Plan Update (adopted in 2008), the City prepared an update of the existing Calabasas Development Code in 2010 to provide General Plan consistency, improve readability, and provide refinement of certain code provisions. The Development Code includes a Mixed-Use zone (CMU) to implement the Mixed-Use General Plan land use district, and accommodates residential densities of 20 units/acre. The majority of areas designated for Mixed-Use are characterized as underutilized and suitable for redevelopment, with several Mixed-Use sites included in the Housing Element sites inventory. Sites designated Mixed Use 1.0 require residential uses to constitute a minimum of 50% of the project's floor area.

The 2030 General Plan also established three distinct multi-family designations at 12, 16 and 20 units/acre, in contrast to the one prior 16 unit/acre multi-family designation. As a means of establishing appropriate development standards for 20 unit/acre zoning in Calabasas, the City's urban design consultant produced a site plan for a multi-family residential prototype utilizing the City's RM16 development standards, including height, setbacks, lot coverage, open space and parking. The outcome of this analysis demonstrated that the City's RM16 development standards could yield 20 units/acre. Therefore, with the exception of density (lot area per unit), the City's new RM20 development standards have been modeled after the current RM16 standards.

Recent approvals of projects with an affordable housing component illustrate how the General Plan land use designations facilitate housing development. In order to accommodate the Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments, the City amended project's General Plan designation from Business-Professional Office to Mixed Use 0.95 and the zoning designation from Commercial Office (CO) to Commercial Mixed Use (CMU). These amendments will allow for conversion of an existing office building to accommodate 42 senior apartments (five deed restricted for very low income households) and 1,600 square feet of commercial use on the 1.92 acre site. Calabasas Creekside is anticipated to be available for occupancy in mid-2022.

For the 80 unit Avanti Townhomes, of which eight units are for very low income households, the City granted height concessions and reduced parking stall dimensions in compliance with the state density bonus law. The site was designated RM20, allowing for up to 90 units on the 4.5 acre site. However, the developer chose to build 80 larger (2,500 sf average), luxury units and did not seek a density bonus.

The City will continue to offer modified standards in support of affordable housing through its density bonus ordinance, described in the following section.

#### **Local Ordinances**

State law now requires jurisdictions to analyze in their Housing Elements any locally adopted ordinances that directly impact the cost and supply of residential development. The City of Calabasas has ordinances which set forth inclusionary housing and commercial impact fee obligations, provide for density bonuses, and regulate condominium conversions and short-term rentals, all of which are analyzed in the following section. The City does not have any growth control measures that could potentially limit housing supply.

*Inclusionary Housing:* The City has established an inclusionary housing program which requires new developments of five or more units to provide between 5 and 20 percent of the total number of units in a project at affordable rent/sales levels. Instead of requiring a fixed percentage of all units to be allocated for affordable housing, the City's program allows for a varying range of affordable units depending on the targeted income level:

- ➤ 20% of units for households with incomes up to 110% of AMI
- ➤ 15% of units for households with incomes up to 90% of AMI
- ➤ 10% units for households with incomes up to 75% of AMI
- > 5% of units for households with incomes up to 50% of AMI

The City's ordinance also outlines the location of assisted housing units through the following requirements:

- The number of assisted housing units in any project, except for those designated for the elderly or disabled, should not exceed forty (40) percent of the total number of units in the project;
- Assisted housing should be located within reasonable proximity to public facilities, including public schools, transportation services and park and recreation facilities;
- Assisted units, except those for the elderly, should be distributed throughout the project site;
- When the above requirements are not feasible, affordable units may be developed and operated at an alternative development site. The resulting linked developments shall be considered a single housing development.

To meet the inclusionary requirements, developers have the option of:

- constructing the new affordable units on or off-site
- converting market rate housing to affordable housing through a "buy down" mechanism and restrictive covenants
- rehabilitating structures that currently do not comply with Uniform Building Code and/or Uniform Housing Code standards
- extending the lifetime of an existing restrictive covenant on affordable units that are "at risk" of conversion to market rate housing within 5 years
- > pay an in-lieu fee that will be deposited into a designated fund to be used for the preservation and development of affordable housing

Because of the City's flexibility in implementing its inclusionary ordinance, the City's inclusionary provisions have not served as a constraint to development. Rather, the ordinance has been a tool to integrate affordable housing within market rate developments. During the 2014-2020 planning period, the following inclusionary projects have been developed or received entitlements:

- ➤ Avanti Calabasas 80 condominiums, including 8 very low income rental units
- ➤ Paxton Calabasas 78 townhome apartments, including 4 very low income units
- Calabasas Creekside (Raznick) Senior Apartments 42 apartments, including 5 very low income units

Both Avanti and Calabasas Creekside were granted density bonus incentives to help offset the cost of providing affordable units. With 17 affordable units produced during the planning period, the inclusionary housing program has been an important tool to producing affordable housing in the community.

**Commercial Impact Fee:** To mitigate the impact of new commercial development on the need for affordable housing, the City has also established an employment-housing linkage program. Under this program, the City requires new commercial developments to provide housing that is affordable to employees within the project site or to pay an in-lieu impact fee.

Impact fees are based on projected employment growth in Calabasas and the associated employee-generated demand for affordable units. Current fee amounts are \$2.00 per square foot for retail developments and \$3.00 per square foot for office and research/development (R&D) uses. The impact fees collected are placed in the Affordable Housing Fund to be used for affordable housing activities.

During the first six years of the planning period (2014-2019), approximately \$147,000 in commercial impact fees were deposited into the Affordable Housing Fund, bringing the total Fund balance to \$1.6 million (June 2020). City Council has directed \$500,000 in Affordable Housing Fund revenues towards the Home Repair and Accessory Dwelling Unit Loan Program.

**Density Bonus:** Numerous amendments have been made to State density bonus law over the last several years. The recent changes to density bonus law deal primarily with reduced parking ratios and exemptions (for sites near transit), requirements for replacement housing, adoption of streamlined processing procedures, bonuses for special needs populations, and other changes designed to facilitate the use of density bonus incentives. Calabasas' Zoning Code Section 17.22 sets forth the City's density bonus incentives consistent with Government Code Sections 65915 through 65918. In summary, applicants of residential projects of five or more units may apply for a density bonus and additional incentive(s) if the project provides for one of the following:

- > 10% of units for lower income households
- > 5% of units for very low income households
- ➤ A senior citizen housing development or mobile home park that limits residency based on age requirements
- > 10% of units in a condominium for moderate income households.
- ➤ 10% of units for transitional foster youth, disabled veterans, or homeless persons
- > 20% of units for lower income students in a student housing development
- ➤ 100% of units for lower income households, except that up to 20 percent may be for moderate income households

The amount of density bonus varies according to the amount by which the percentage of affordable housing units exceeds the established minimum percentage, but generally ranges from 20-35 percent above the specified General Plan density. In addition to the density bonus, eligible projects may receive 1-3 additional development incentives, depending on the proportion of affordable units and level of income targeting.

Pursuant to State requirements and at the request of the developer, the City will also permit a reduced parking ratio for density bonus projects. To the extent the density bonus cannot be accommodated under Calabasas' development standards, the City will modify applicable standards to accommodate the bonus.

Projects which comply with Calabasas' inclusionary housing ordinance (and meet the requirements of Code Sections 17.22.020(A) and 17.22.020(B) are eligible for density bonuses and incentives. Staff provides information on density bonus incentives and inclusionary housing requirements to all project applicants. The Avanti mixed-use project and Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments were both granted density bonuses during the planning period. In addition, the pending West Village project is also proposing use of density bonus incentives.

**Condominium Conversions:** As a means of maintaining the supply of rental units and preserving the affordable housing stock, the City requires the approval of a tentative map, and parcel or final map prior to any condominium conversion. The City also mandates a Relocation Assistance Program that will assist displaced tenants in finding equivalent or better housing. Under the Calabasas General Plan, the City will not approve any condominium conversion when the vacancy rate within the City for multifamily housing is less than four percent.

Between 2014 and 2019, there were no applications for condominium conversions. While the City has not received any condominium conversion requests, it may be appropriate to strengthen the City's current Ordinance to preserve the existing rental housing stock and require affordable units in any future projects approved for conversion. Similar to many jurisdictions with inclusionary housing ordinances, Calabasas may want to extend its inclusionary housing requirements to condominium conversions to provide affordable homeownership opportunities.

**Short Term Rentals:** A short-term vacation rental (also called a vacation rental or STR) is a rental of a residential dwelling unit or accessory building for periods of less than 30 consecutive days. Over the past few years, short-term rentals have become an increasingly popular form of lodging throughout the country.

The City recognizes the potential land use issues that can arise from operating short-term rentals in Calabasas' neighborhoods, such as parking, noise and trash. In addition, housing units that might otherwise provide long term rental housing for tenants are removed from the rental market, further impacting the shortage of available rental housing in the community. Due to these factors, in 2018, the City Council adopted 7.12.175 of the Calabasas Municipal Code, prohibiting short-term rentals except for lawfully approved hotels, motels, and bed and breakfast inns.

## 2. Provision for a Variety of Housing Types

Housing Element law specifies that jurisdictions must identify adequate sites to be made available through appropriate zoning and development standards to encourage the development of various types of housing for all economic segments of the population, including multi-family rental housing, manufactured housing, mobile homes, accessory dwelling units, emergency shelters, transitional housing and single room occupancies. Table 27 summarizes the housing types permitted in Calabasas' zone districts.

**Table 27: Housing Types by Residential Zone Category** 

Housing Types	Residential/Commercial Zone District									
Permitted Permitted	RS	RM	RMH	RR	RC	PD	НМ	СМИ	СТ	CL
Single-Family	Р	Р		Р	Р	Р	Р			
Multiple-Family		Р				Р		С	С	
Manufactured Housing	Р	Р		Р	Р		Р			
Accessory Dwelling Units	Р	Р		Р	Р	Р	Р			
Senior Residential Projects		Р				Р		С	С	
Residential Care Homes ( <u>&lt;</u> 6)	Р	Р	Р	Р	Р		Р			
Residential Care Homes (7+)		С						С	С	
Transitional and Supportive Housing	Р	Р								
Emergency Shelters										Р
Single Room Occupancy (SRO) <sup>1</sup>								С		

**P** = Permitted Use **C** = Conditionally Permitted Use

#### **Multi-Family Rental Housing**

Multi-family dwelling units make up almost one-quarter (23%) of the housing stock in Calabasas. The majority of these units are in two large apartment communities: the 698-unit Malibu Canyon and the 600-unit Avalon Calabasas (formerly Archstone). The new Avanti project has 80 units, Paxton has 78 units and Calabasas Creekside has 42 units. The updated Calabasas Development Code now allows for multi-family housing in the RM (Multi-Family Residential) zone as a permitted use, eliminating the prior Conditional Use Permit (CUP) requirement. The City allows for densities of 2-20 units per acre in the RM zone, with additional densities achievable through density bonuses. In addition, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Similar to hotels, SROs are also permitted in the CO and CB zones, subject to a CUP.

following commercial zones conditionally permit multi-family and senior housing: CT (Old Town Commercial) and CMU (Mixed Use Commercial). The Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartment project (formerly the Raznick Mixed Use project) included changing project's General Plan designation from Business-Professional Office to Mixed Use 0.95 and the zoning designation from Commercial Office (CO) to Commercial Mixed Use (CMU).

A major focus of the City's 2010 Development Code was to establish clear, well-defined development standards, allowing for a greater range of uses "by right" without the requirement for a CUP. For example, multi-family development no longer requires a CUP in the RM or PD districts. Elimination of the CUP serves to facilitate development by providing greater certainty to developers. Also, the PD and CMU zones allow more flexibility in integrating residential uses within the community.

### **Manufactured Housing/ Mobile Homes and Mobilehome Parks**

The City's Development Code considers mobile homes for permanent occupancy (defined as manufactured housing by the National Manufactured Housing Construction and Safety Standards Act of 1974) the same as single-family dwellings, and permits mobile homes (Section 17.12.020) in all zoning districts that allow single-family housing. Mobile homes are required to be placed on a foundation system in compliance with Section 18551 of the Health and Safety Code, and are required to be designed and constructed with roof eave and gable overhangs of not less than one foot.

Calabasas' prior Development Code permitted mobile home park subdivisions within the RM zone, subject to a Conditional Use Permit. As part of the 2030 General Plan Update, the City identified preservation of its existing mobile home park as a high priority, and developed a separate RMH mobile home park General Plan land use designation and zoning district to aid in maintaining the park in long-term mobile home park use.

This Housing Element includes a program for continued preservation of the mobile home park, including providing information on the State's Mobilehome Park Rehabilitation and Resident Ownership Program (MPROP). In January 2004, the City initiated a Rental Assistance Program for lower income tenants in the park, providing for a monthly subsidy for income-qualified tenants. In December 2010, the City Council made the Rental Assistance Program permanent and as of March 2020, this program was providing assistance to 42 residing in the mobilehome park.

#### **Accessory Dwelling Units**

Accessory dwelling units (also known as second units or "granny" flats) are complete independent housing units that can be either detached or attached from an existing single-family residence. Based on their relatively small size, and because they do not require paying for land or major new infrastructure, accessory dwelling units ("ADUs") are considered affordable by design. ADUs can provide affordable housing options for family members, seniors, students, in-home health care providers, and other small household types. ADUs can also be useful to generate additional rental income for the homeowner, making homeownership more financially feasible.

The State passed legislation in 2017 and 2019 to further assist and support the development of ADUs, including "by right" approval for units less than 850 square feet for a one-bedroom and 1,000 square feet for a two-bedroom unit. These projects must be

approved at the staff level to help streamline the permit process. In January 2020, the City Council adopted an ordinance amending the City's Zoning Code to be compliant with the latest State laws. This included updated standards for ADUs and Junior ADUs. Highlights of the ordinance amendment include:

- ADUs are permitted in all residential zoning districts, with the exception of the RMH (mobile home park) zone.
- > Standards added for junior ADUS, with a size limit of 500 square feet.
- Maximum square footage of attached and detached ADUs (Attached units shall not exceed the lesser of 1,200 sq. ft. or 50% of the living area of the primary unit; detached units – maximum 1,200 square feet).
- ➤ Height limits set at 16 feet for one-story units. If the unit is located above the garage; the applicable zoning district's height standards apply.
- > One off-street parking space for the ADU is required in accordance with State law (exceptions are detailed in the ordinance).

Calabasas recognizes that ADUs can be a housing opportunity for lower and moderate income households, including seniors and caregivers. The following describes recent activity related to ADUs in the City:

- ➤ Between the years 2014-2020, a total of 22 building permits were issued by the City for ADUs. In the first year since adoption of the City's updated ordinance (Jan-Dec 2020), the City has seen a dramatic increase in ADUs, with seven units approved and another six units in process. These numbers well exceed the goal of 12 units set out in the previous Housing Element.
- ➤ In 2019, the City Council adopted a resolution expanding the City's Home Repair Program to include loans for the development of ADUs. Funds in the amount of \$500,000 from the Affordable Housing Fund were designated for the program. The first \$50,000 loan was issued in 2020 to assist a senior homeowner convert a garage into an ADU.
- ➤ The updated Housing Element incudes a program for the City to incentivize and promote ADUs, including the creation of architectural prototypes and continued use of the Home Repair Program to provide funding income qualified households to add an ADU.

The City's website provides information about the ADU review process as well as the development standards.

### **Housing for Persons with Disabilities**

Both the federal Fair Housing Act and the California Fair Employment and Housing Act impose an affirmative duty on local governments to make reasonable accommodations (i.e., modifications or exceptions) in their zoning and other land use regulations when such accommodations may be necessary to afford disabled persons an equal opportunity to use and enjoy a dwelling. Furthermore, pursuant to SB 520, State housing element statutes now require jurisdictions to evaluate constraints upon the development, maintenance, and improvement of housing for persons with disabilities, and demonstrate local efforts to remove such governmental constraints. Housing for persons with

disabilities encompasses a wide range of housing types, including: physically accessible housing for persons with mobility impairments; residential care facilities for persons with disabilities or the elderly; group homes; housing for persons with Alzheimer's and HIV/AIDS; housing with support services; and transitional housing that serves homeless with disabilities.

The City's provisions for housing for persons with disabilities includes:

- ➤ The Development Code permits residential care facilities<sup>8</sup> (for six or fewer residents) in the RS, RM, RMH, RR, RC, OS and HM zoning districts.
- Residential care facilities for seven or more residents are conditionally permitted in the RM, CMU and CT districts. The CUP establishes conditions to ensure compatibility of the use within the neighborhood context, and does not regulate the user or establish undue conditions that serve as a constraint.
- Assisted living and congregate care facilities are permitted with a CUP in the RM zone, as well as in most commercial zoning districts.
- ➤ Extended care and convalescent care facilities providing nursing and healthrelated care (such as skilled nursing facilities, extended care facilities, convalescent and rest homes, board and care homes) are conditionally permitted in all commercial zones, with the exception of the Old Town Commercial (CT) zone.
- The City does not impose any spacing requirements between residential care facilities or other special needs housing. The City has not adopted any occupancy standards that apply to unrelated adults or families.
- ➤ The Community Development Director maintains the authority, without a public hearing, to grant setback and other minor modifications to the Zoning Code to provide reasonable accommodation to persons with disabilities. For example, handicapped ramps or guardrails (up to 30" in height) are permitted to intrude into the standard setbacks required under zoning to allow first floor access for physically disabled residents.
- ➤ The City provides housing rehabilitation funds to income-qualified households for accessibility improvements.

The City adopted Development Code Chapter 17.38, Reasonable Accommodation consistent with federal and state laws regarding providing reasonable accommodations. The Ordinance creates a procedure for an individual with a disability to request a reasonable accommodation from land use or zoning regulations, policies, and practices to provide that individual with an equal opportunity to use and enjoy a dwelling. A decision on whether to grant a reasonable accommodation is made by the Director of Community Development. If the request for an accommodation is related to another discretionary permit, then the request is processed with the project as a whole. However, no special permit is required for the granting of a reasonable accommodation and no fee is required to apply. Calabasas has conducted a review of zoning, permit processing and building

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Residential care homes are defined as facilities providing residential social and personal care for children, the elderly, and persons with some limits on their ability for self-care, but where medical care is not a major element. Includes children's homes, halfway houses, rehabilitation centers, group homes and hospices.

code requirements, and has not identified any barriers to the provision of accessible housing.

The North Los Angeles County Regional Center (NLACRC) serves over 28,000 individuals with developmental disabilities and their families in the San Fernando, Santa Clarita and Antelope Valleys. Within zip code 91302, which encompasses greater Calabasas, the Regional Center currently provides services to 159 residents with developmental disabilities. Of these residents, approximately 97.5 percent (155 persons) live with a parent, family member or guardian with the remaining 2.5 percent live in a foster/group home or an independent/supportive living program.<sup>9</sup> These percentages highlight the need for people with developmentally disabled family members to have a variety of housing options to provide ongoing care and support.

## **Transitional and Supportive Housing**

SB 2, effective January 2008, amended Housing Element law regarding planning and approval for transitional and supportive housing. Specifically, SB 2 requires transitional and supportive housing to be treated as a residential use and only subject to those restrictions that apply to other residential uses of the same type in the same zone. For example, if the transitional housing is a multi-family use proposed in a multi-family zone, then zoning should treat the transitional housing the same as other multifamily uses in the proposed zone.

Transitional housing is defined as temporary housing (generally six months to two years) for a homeless individual or family who is transitioning to permanent housing. This housing can take several forms, including group housing or multi-family units, and typically includes a supportive services component to allow individuals to gain necessary life skills in support of independent living.

Supportive housing is generally defined as permanent, affordable housing with on-site services that help residents' transition into stable, more productive lives. Services may include childcare, after-school tutoring, career counseling, etc. Supportive housing can come in many different configurations, ranging from a small, service-intensive group home, to a multi-family development where tenants with disabilities live alongside other ambulatory tenants.

There are currently no supportive or transitional housing facilities within Calabasas. The City's Development Code has definitions of supportive and transitional housing and identifies these housing types as permitted uses within the R-SF and R-MF zone districts. As stated above, SB 2 requires transitional and supportive housing to be treated as a residential use of the same type in the same zone. These housing types can take the form of single or multi-family uses, or group housing. The City has included a program in the Housing Element to amend the Development Code to explicitly allow transitional and supportive housing in all zones where residential is permitted, including mixed use zones, subject to the same restrictions as similar residential uses in the same zone.

AB 2162 (effective January 2019), added additional provisions that jurisdictions must address in their regulation of supportive housing. These include:

CITY of CALABASAS

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> California Department of Developmental Services, Consumer County by California ZIP Code and Residence Type. Regional Center and Early Start Consumers, June 2020.

- Allowance of supportive housing as a use by-right in all zones where multi-family and mixed-use is permitted, including non-residential zones permitting multi-family uses, if the proposed development meets specified criteria<sup>10</sup>
- Approval of an application for supportive housing that meets these criteria within specified periods
- ➤ Elimination of parking requirements for supportive housing located within ½ mile of public transit

The Housing Element program described above to amend the Development Code allow transitional and supportive housing in all zones where residential is permitted will also address these new requirements.

## **Emergency Shelters**

SB 2 also requires the Housing Element to address new planning and approval requirements for emergency shelters. Jurisdictions with an unmet need for emergency shelters for the homeless are required to identify a zone(s) where emergency shelters will be allowed as a permitted use without a conditional use or other discretionary permit. The identified zone must have sufficient capacity to accommodate the shelter need, and at a minimum provide capacity for at least one year-round shelter. Permit processing, development and management standards for emergency shelters must be objective and facilitate the development of, or conversion to, emergency shelters.

California Health and Safety Code (Section 50801) defines an emergency shelter as "housing with minimal supportive services for homeless persons that is limited to occupancy of six months or less by a homeless person. No individual or household may be denied emergency shelter because of an inability to pay."

As discussed previously in the homeless section of the Needs Assessment, due to the relative inaccessibility and distance from urban centers, Calabasas does not attract many homeless individuals or families. The 2020 Greater Los Angeles Homeless Count, conducted by the Los Angeles Homeless Service Authority (LAHSA) included a count of homeless on the street, in shelters (emergency, transitional and safe haven), hidden homeless and youth. This count was done across the County on a single night in January 2020. Within Calabasas, the 2020 count identified two homeless (both unsheltered on the night of the PIT Count).<sup>11</sup>

Pursuant to SB 2, Calabasas conducted a review of its zoning districts and determined the Business Limited Intensity land use district (Commercial Limited CL zoning) most conducive for location of an emergency homeless shelter. The City's Land Use Element designates West Calabasas Road as Business Limited Intensity, and the current land use survey identifies approximately 24 vacant acres. While much of this acreage is hilly, staff has identified flat, buildable pads on several parcels, totaling approximately 11 acres. Parcels along Calabasas Road are accessible to transit, both from the City's free Shuttle Bus with routes throughout the City, and from the MTA bus line that connects Calabasas

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Criteria include: 55 year affordability restriction; occupancy by lower income households receiving public funding to ensure affordability; min. 25% of units, or 12 units, whichever is greater, restricted to residents who meet criteria of target population; a written plan for providing supportive services.

The Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority, 2020 Greater Los Angeles Homeless County, 2020.
 CITY of CALABASAS
 BACKGROUND REPORT

with the rest of the San Fernando Valley and Thousand Oaks to the west. Services within a one-mile radius include a Ralph's grocery store, a gas station, the Civic Center and library, and access to the Ventura Freeway.

The 2010 Development Code modified the Zoning Ordinance to permit shelters in the CL zone subject to the same development and management standards as other permitted uses in the zone. The City's CL development standards are appropriate to facilitate emergency shelters, and can be summarized as follows:

Minimum lot size: 5,000 sq ft
 Minimum lot width: 50 ft
 Floor Area Ratio: 0.2

Site coverage: maximum 72% of net site area

Building height: 35 ft

> Front and rear yard setback: 20 ft

> Side yard setback: none, or 20 ft if adjacent residential zone

Rear Yard Setback: none; 20' if adjacent to residential zone

In addition to application of CL development standards, as permitted under SB 2, the City has adopted the following standards to regulate emergency shelters to enhance compatibility:

- Maximum number of occupants is 20;
- ➤ A minimum distance of 1,000 feet shall be maintained between shelters
- Maximum stay at the facility shall not exceed 180 consecutive days
- > One off-street parking space shall be provided for every 250 square feet<sup>12</sup>
- An interior waiting area shall be provided which contains a minimum of 200 square feet
- > Exterior lighting shall be provided for the entire outdoor area;
- Security personnel shall be provided during the hours the shelter is in operation

#### Single Room Occupancy (SRO)

Single Room Occupancy (SRO) residences are small, one room units (generally 80-250 sq. ft.) occupied by a single individual, and may either have shared or private kitchen and bathroom facilities. SROs are rented on a monthly basis, typically without rental deposit, and can provide an entry point into the housing market for extremely low income individuals, formerly homeless and disabled persons. Calabasas classifies SRO uses the same as hotels and motels. SROs typically have individual bathrooms and thus similar to hotels, are permitted in the CR, CMU, CB and CO zone districts, subject to a conditional use permit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Pursuant to AB 139 (effective January 2020), the City has included a program in the Housing Element to amend the current parking standards for shelters from a ratio based on the size of the structure to a ratio based on to the number of shelter staff.

## 3. Development Fees

The City collects various fees from development to cover the costs of processing permits, including fees for planning approvals, subdivision map act approvals, environmental review, plan check services, and building permits, among others. Table 28 provides a listing of residential development permit fees in Calabasas.

**Table 28: Development Fees for Residential Projects** 

Fee Type	Fee Amount
Planning and Zoning Fees	i ce Amount
Pre-Application Review	\$1,071
Administrative Plan Review	\$964 – single unit; \$1,927 – all other
Development Plan Review	\$9,021
Site Plan Review*	\$2,017 – single unit; \$4,023 – all other
Conditional Use Permit	\$1,939 – single unit; \$3,877 – all other
Variance*	\$1,277 – single unit; \$2,555 – all other
Development Agreement	\$6,847
General Plan Amendment	\$6,298
Zone Change	\$4,326
Specific Plan	\$13,335
Oak Tree Permit	\$1,613 – single unit; \$3,227 – all other
Tentative Tract Map	\$6,824
Tentative Parcel Map	\$5,547
Scenic Corridor Permit	\$426 – single unit; \$607 all other
Community Development Forum Fee	\$535
Impact Fees	
Park and Recreation Fee	Amount of parkland dedication = # project units x pop density/unit x .003 In-lieu fee based on fair market land value of park acreage dedication requirement.
Traffic Impact Fee	\$1,230/unit
Bridge & Thoroughfare Fee	\$1,717 per townhome unit
(Westside of City)	\$1,971 per multi-family unit
	\$3,179 per single-family unit
Inclusionary Housing In-Lieu Fee	\$19,000 per apartment unit
	\$48,100 per townhome/condo unit
School District Fees	\$66,900 per single-family unit
Environmental Fees	\$3.20/sq.ft.
Exempt Projects	\$448
Negative Declaration	\$1,333
Mitigated Negative Declaration	\$7,866
Environmental Impact Report	\$10,030
Environmental Consultant	Cost + 15%
Environmental Consultant	COSI + 15%

Source: City of Calabasas, Planning Department Fee Schedule, Effective July 1,2020; Las Virgenes Unified School District.

As a means of assessing the cost that City fees contribute to the cost of development in Calabasas, the City has calculated the total Planning, Building, Pubic Works, and Impact Fees associated with development of a hypothetical 60-unit apartment project. As indicated in Table 29, City development fees run approximately \$13,750 per unit, exclusive of School District, Water District and County Public Works fees, and assuming on-site provision of required inclusionary housing units. Fees for condominium projects and single-family subdivisions would be somewhat higher as they would also be subject to parkland dedication requirements under the Quimby Act.

Table 29: City Development Fees for 60 Unit Apartment Project

Fee Type	Total Project Fees	Fees per Unit		
Planning/Building Fees				
Community Development Forums	\$535.00	\$8.92		
Pre-Application	\$1,071.00	\$17.85		
Site Plan Review	\$4,023.00	\$67.05		
Oak Tree Permit	\$3,227.00	\$53.78		
Scenic Corridor Permit	\$852.00	\$14.20		
Environmental (CEQA)	\$100,000.00*	\$1,666.67		
Public Hearing Notification	\$300.00	\$5.00		
Doc. Scanning & Archiving	\$316.00	\$5.27		
CEQA - Environmental Impact Report	\$10,030.00	\$167.17		
Building Permit (including inspection)	\$250,558.00	\$4,175.97		
Electrical Permit	\$18,860.00	\$314.33		
Mechanical Permit	\$12,737.00	\$212.28		
Plumbing Permit	\$25,427.00	\$420.78		
Sub-Total	\$427,756.00	\$7,129.27		
Public Works Fees				
Traffic Mitigation Fee	\$73,800.00	\$1,230.00		
Bridge & Thoroughfare Fee	\$118,260.00	\$1,971.00		
Traffic and Parking Reviews	\$2,251.00	\$37.52		
Engineering Review	\$200,000.00	\$3,333.33		
Grading Permit	\$2,889.00	\$48.15		
Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan	\$561.00	\$9.35		
Sub-Total	\$397,761	\$6,629.35		
Total City Development Fees	\$825,517.00	\$13,758.62		

Source: City of Calabasas Community Development Department, 2020.

Based on a \$250/sf average development cost for a 1,200 sf low rise apartment (Metropolitan Policy Program at Brookings www.brookings.edu 5/5/20), Calabasas development fees constitute less than five percent of unit development costs. In summary, Calabasas' planning and development fees do not serve as a constraint to the production

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Table 29 presents those fees charged by the City of Calabasas, and do not include those charged by the School District, sewer and water connection fees charged by the Water District, or drainage fees charged by Los Angeles County Public Works.

housing. Furthermore, as an incentive for the provision of on-site affordable housing units, the City has updated its inclusionary in-lieu fees to reflect full cost recovery, and offers fee reductions as an incentive through the density bonus ordinance. And pursuant to AB 641, the City allows developers of affordable housing projects with a minimum of 49 percent very low and low income units to defer payment of development fees until issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

## 4. Processing and Permit Procedures

Calabasas' development process and permitting procedures are not a constraint to development. Before development can occur, it is necessary to obtain certain permits and approvals. These procedures, although necessary to ensure that the development is safe and in compliance with local regulations and building code requirements, can sometimes lead to delays in projects and subsequently increase costs. Moreover, excessive processing time may act as a constraint on the production of affordable housing, because it increases carrying costs to the developer for land, financing, and so forth.

Recognizing the complexity of the development process, the City offers easy-to-read brochures to help developers and homeowners better understand planning and development procedures. The City is also committed to an efficient review process. In particular, the City offers expedited CEQA (California Environmental Quality Act) review for residential developments with units affordable to lower and moderate-income households.

The following describes the different levels of decision-making bodies in Calabasas, and the responsibilities of each:

- The **Development Review Committee (DRC)** consists of a representative from relevant City Departments (Community Development, Public Works, etc.) and other agencies involved with the physical development of the City. The DRC was created to review development/improvement proposals, provide applicants with design comments, and make recommendations to the Community Development Director and/or Planning Commission, as provided by the Development Code. The DRC serves as a recommending body on conditional use permits, variances, tentative maps, and planned developments.
- The City's **Architectural Review Panel (ARP)** reviews projects for their aesthetic quality. The ARP makes advisory recommendations to the Planning Commission and the City Council in matters pertaining to site plan reviews, and evaluating the architectural designs of buildings, landscape plans and other site features. The ARP is made up of three members and two alternate members appointed by the Planning Commission, with at least one member required to be a licensed architect. The ARP reviews commercial and residential projects within scenic corridors, the Old Topanga/Highlands Overlay Areas, proposed subdivisions, hillside developments, and other projects as requested by the Community Development Director or Planning Commission.
- The Community Development Director has decision-making authority on administrative plan reviews, minor use permits, sign permits, minor scenic corridor permits, temporary use permits and zoning clearances. For subdivisions, the Director has authority over lot line adjustments, lot mergers,

- conditional certificates, and certificates of compliance, and provides recommendations on tentative maps.
- For projects that require a conditional use permit, site plan review, scenic corridor permit, tentative map or variance, the **Planning Commission** serves as the decision-making body. Property owners within 500 feet of the proposed project are notified. A public hearing is scheduled at least 10 days and not more than 60 days after acceptance of the fully completed application.

The typical review process for a multi-family development application in Calabasas can be described as follows. As a means of saving time and costs, applicants are encouraged to request a **pre-application conference** with staff prior to completion of project design. The purpose of this conference is to inform the applicant of relevant Development Code requirements, explore possible modifications to the project, and to identify any technical studies that may be necessary for the environmental review process. The pre-application conference is conducted with the Development Review Committee, providing the applicant with early input from all relevant departments and external entities. The cost for the pre-application conference is currently \$988, and is credited towards future application costs.

Prior to submittal of a formal development application, the applicant is required to hold a Community Development Forum, to inform the public of their intent to develop a site with a new multi-family or mixed-use project. Upon submittal of the **formal development application**, City staff conducts a completeness review, and informs the applicant in writing within 30 days of any missing information. Corrections and/or additions are made to the project application and supporting documents, and resubmitted to staff. Review includes distribution of the project to members of the Development Review Committee. If the DRC doesn't have any questions, staff maintains responsibility for review. To the extent members of the DRC do have questions or concerns with the application, a DRC meeting is scheduled with the applicant within 30 days. Once the application is revised and resubmitted to address identified issues, it is forwarded on to the Architectural Review Panel for review of project aesthetics.

Upon completion of project review by the Development Review Committee, and as necessary, the Architectural Review Panel, the City holds a second Community Development Forum in order to provide the public with information regarding a project that will soon be scheduled for a public hearing. After the second Community Development Forum is completed and story poles are installed, the application will be deemed complete. A staff report is prepared summarizing the conclusions of the Department and each reviewing body. The staff report includes recommendations on the approval, approval with conditions, or disapproval of the application, and is provided to the applicant. In total, the average processing time for multi-family development in Calabasas ranges from six to twelve months. For example, the 80 unit Avanti mixed use project received project approval within 12 months of submittal of a complete application.

Average processing times in Calabasas to obtain a permit to construct a new single-family residence on a legal lot is six months. Most remaining single-family parcels are either within scenic corridors or are hillside parcels, and would therefore fall within the parameters of the Architectural Review Panel and would require, at a minimum, a public hearing with the Planning Commission, thereby adding to the processing times.

In accordance with section 65913.4 of the California Government Code, also known as SB 35, a permit applicant may submit an application for a development that is subject to the streamlined, ministerial approval process and is not subject to a conditional use permit, if they meet the objective planning standards as outlined in the Government Code. Since the adoption of this section of the Government Code, the City has not yet received an application under these provisions. The City is prepared to act in accordance with the provisions of California Government Code Section 65913.4 and to provide streamlined, ministerial approval when it applies.

#### **New Technologies**

The City's Community Development Department adopted a new permit tracking system, SmartGov, in May 2019. SmartGov is a centralized, web-based land management system that links the City's Building and Safety, Planning, Code Enforcement, and Public Works Departments into one unified system that can efficiently manage the various tasks of the different departments. Activities such as permit issuance, inspections, and citizen inquiries are accessible to City staff through SmartGov. The system also allows residents to request inspections, find the status of their project, and achieve other simple tasks online. SmartGov is expected to dramatically increase the efficiency of the development review and permitting process and lessen internal administrative costs.

In the Fall of 2019, the City applied and was awarded an SB 2 planning grant from the State. The application for these funds included up to \$100,000 to provide enhanced technology to expedite the building permit process. This effort will involve upgrading the City's new permit database to include public access to allow online permit submittals, eplan check and mobile building inspections.

## 5. Site Improvements

Before permits requiring discretionary action can be granted, it must first be determined that public facilities are adequate to accommodate any increased demand created by the proposed project. Residential developers are required to provide and/or fund infrastructure necessary for utility connections to the project, including water, electric and sewer, as well as funding their portion of any off-site system expansions or upgrades that are necessary to serve the project. The cost of off-site improvements varies depending on the nature of development (i.e., hillside or flatland development).

Developers of projects that will include streets are required to install the streets, curbs, gutters, sidewalks, utility systems and landscaping; these facilities are typically dedicated to the City. Subdivisions are designed to provide rights-of-way for pedestrian paths, bikeways and multiple use trails as identified in the General Plan Circulation Element. Calabasas' residential street standards are based upon the County of Los Angeles Subdivision Ordinance, and include the following street right-of-way widths:

Cul-de-sacs (up to 700 ft.)	58 ft.
Cul-de-sacs (> 700 ft)	60 ft.
Local streets (up to 1,400 ft)	58 ft
Local streets (> 1,400 ft)	60 ft.
Collector streets	64 ft.

Since Calabasas is a built-out community, most residential projects are small infill developments and not of a size that warrant a circulation system other than private driveways. Most future development will necessitate few site improvement requirements, and thus not add significant costs to development.

## 6. Building Code

State law requires that all jurisdictions in California enforce the building codes as mandated by the California Building Standards Commission. The State building codes establish construction standards necessary to protect public health, safety and welfare, and the local enforcement of these codes does not unnecessarily constrain the development of housing. The City has adopted by ordinance the following model codes, along with all required updates:

- California Residential Code (2019)
- California Building Code (2019)
- California Mechanical Code (2019)
- California Plumbing Code (2019)
- California Electrical Code (2019)
- County of Los Angeles Fire Code (2019)
- California Energy Code (2019)
- California Green Building Standards Code (2019)

The City of Calabasas, like most cities in California has adopted the Uniform Building Code (UBC). This code includes minimum standards for building materials, plumbing, electrical, fire, energy and other minimum standards. It is also intended to protect the public and provide a healthy and safe dwelling unit. These minimum standards cannot be revised to be less stringent without sacrificing basic safety considerations.

In terms of the local enforcement of the Building code, while staff monitors housing conditions, code enforcement in Calabasas is primarily complaint based. And as described under Housing Element Programs, the City will continue to offer a Home Repair Program to assist low and moderate income property owners of dilapidated units cited for code violations to make needed repairs to make the units safe and habitable.

## B. MARKET CONSTRAINTS

Potential market constraints included within the provisions of the Housing Element requirements include issues of land costs, construction costs, availability of financing, and length of time for building permit issuance. Analysis of these issues can shed light on the private market forces, which affect housing availability and affordability.

### 1. Price of Land

A key component of the total cost of housing is the price of raw land. The diminished supply of land available for residential construction combined with a fairly high demand for such development has served to keep the cost of land relatively high in cities across Southern California. As an example, a 4.5 acre mixed use site cost \$15 million, equating to \$76/sf, whereas a 21 acre multi-family site with 5 flat, buildable acres cost \$4.5 million, equating to \$20/sf of buildable acreage. While Calabasas cannot control costs driven by market conditions, it can continue to offer increased densities and reduced parking requirements to effectively reduce the per unit cost of land.

Site improvements also contribute to the cost of land. Most remaining vacant single-family parcels in Calabasas have severe topographic constraints and necessitate significant grading to accommodate development. Infill parcels identified by the 2030 General Plan Update for multi-family and mixed-use development for the most part don't face the same topographic constraints, and are thus less costly to develop than the hillside areas.

### 2. Cost of Construction

In addition to land and site development costs, a major cost associated with the development of housing is the cost of building materials, which have increased faster than the rise in inflation in recent years. Over the past three years (2017-2020), the cost of raw materials (lumber, concrete, steel, etc.) have increased by 20 percent, compared to a 7.5 percent rise in inflation. This particularly impacts the cost of high-density, Type V construction which requires costly non-combustible steel-frame construction materials. Labor costs have also risen dramatically, and are compounded by a shortage of qualified construction workers.

A reduction in amenities and the quality of building materials (above a minimum acceptability for health, safety, and adequate performance) can result in lower development costs. As part of the City's density bonus program, the City may allow affordable units to be slightly smaller in size (maintaining the same number of bedrooms) and have different interior finishes than market rate units, provided all project units are comparable in construction quality and exterior design. Another factor that can reduce construction costs is the economies of scale realized with a greater number of units built at one time; this is of particular benefit when density bonuses are used for the provision of affordable housing.

## 3. Availability of Mortgage and Rehabilitation Financing

The availability of financing in a community depends on a number of factors, including the type of lending institutions active in the community, lending practices, rates and fees charged, laws and regulations governing financial institutions, and equal access to those institutions. Through analysis of Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) data on the disposition of residential loan applications, an assessment can be made of the availability of residential financing within a community.

Table 30 summarizes HMDA data for both Calabasas and Los Angeles County, providing information on the approval status of all home purchase, refinance and home improvement loan applications during 2019.

- Of the total 457 completed applications for home purchase loans in Calabasas, 86 percent were approved and 14 percent were denied, comparable to the approval rate County-wide. Review of mortgage loan denial rates by Calabasas' census tracts does not identify any tract with denial rates ten points or above the 14 percent citywide average.
- ➤ The volume of applications for refinance loans in Calabasas was more than double that of home purchase loans, with 80 percent of the total 1,094 applications receiving approval and 20 percent denied. This approval rate is higher than the regional average.
- ➤ The number of applications for home improvement loans in Calabasas was 132, with 55 percent of applicants receiving approval and 45 percent being denied, a higher denial rate than County-wide. Home improvement loans typically have higher denial rates because homeowners may already have high debt-to-income ratios on their home mortgage or refinance loans.

Table 30: Status of Home Purchase and Home Improvement Loans 2019

	Completed	Loans Approved		Loans Denied	
Loan Type	Loan Applications	Calabasas	L.A. County	Calabasas	L.A. County
Conventional Home	e Purchase Loar	ıs			
# Applications	457	395		62	
% Approval/Denial		86%	87%	14%	13%
Refinancing	Refinancing				
# Applications	1,094	871		223	
% Approval/Denial		80%	73%	20%	27%
Home Improvement Loans					
# Applications	132	73		59	
% Approval/Denial		55%	69%	45%	31%

Source: Home Mortgage Disclosure Act Data, 2019. Compiled by Karen Warner Associates. Note: Approved loans include: loans originated and applications approved but not accepted. Denial rate based on applications that went through complete underwriting process, and exclude applications withdrawn or files closed for incompleteness.

## 4. Requests to Develop at Densities Below Those Permitted

New State Housing Element law now requires the non-governmental constraints analysis to evaluate developer requests to build at densities below the density identified in the Housing Element sites inventory. Calabasas' recent experience has been that townhome projects tend to build at below maximum densities, while apartment and mixed-use projects develop at the upper end of the density range. The following presents the developed densities in recent multi-family projects in the City, all of which were zoned to permit densities up to 20 units/acre:

- Avanti Townhomes 17.8 units/acre
- Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments 22 units/acre
- Paxton Apartments 3.7 du/acre gross (15.6 units/acre net)

The Avanti townhome project provided large, 2,500 sf units, resulting in densities approximately 10% below the maximum. In contrast, Calabasas Creekside will provide smaller senior citizen apartments and was granted a density bonus to exceed the maximum 20 unit/acre density. The majority of the 21 acre site the Paxton project was built on is sloped and not developable, resulting in a 3.7 unit/acre overall density, though calculating density based on the site's five buildable acres results in a net density of 15.6 units per acre.

In order to incentivize development which better implements densities planned in the Housing Element sites inventory, the City is evaluating establishment of an affordable housing overlay zone. Parcels designated with an affordable housing overlay would receive significant density increases above the base density, along with a variety of development incentives, in exchange for development of a greater percentage of affordable units than required by the City's inclusionary ordinance or State density bonus law. The City is also considering establishing a new minimum 20 du/acre land use designation with associated development standards to support achievement of these densities.

## Length of Time between Application Approval and Building Permit Issuance

New Housing Element law now also requires an examination of the length of time between receiving approval for a housing development and submittal of an application for building permits. The time between application approval and building permit issuance is influenced by a number of factors, none of which are directly impacted by the City. Factors that may impact the timing of building permit issuance include: required technical or engineering studies; completion of construction drawings and detailed site and landscape design; securing construction and permanent financing; and retention of a building contractor and subcontractors.

The majority of residential permits in Calabasas are for single-family homes, with building permit issuance generally taking six to twelve months after Planning approvals. Hillside properties may take a few months longer due to the need for technical and engineering

studies. The 80 unit Avanti mixed use project provides an example of the time frame for a recent multi-family project. This project received entitlements in July 2013 and grading permits were issued in April 2014. The project consisted of phased construction of eight buildings, with the first occupancy issued in April 2016.

In Calabasas, most approved projects are constructed in a reasonable time period. As of October 31, 2020 only four units approved over one year ago had not yet pulled building permits.

On March 4, 2020, Governor Newsom proclaimed a state of emergency due to COVID-19. The Legislature observed that the pandemic slowed the processing of approvals, permits, and entitlements for housing development projects, resulting in the premature expiration of some entitlements. AB 1561, effective January 1, 2020 finds, "A uniform statewide entitlement extension measure is necessary to avoid the significant statewide cost and allocation of local government staff resources associated with addressing individual permit extensions on a case-by-case basis." Under this legislation, any housing entitlement that would expire between March 4, 2020 and December 31, 2021 is to be extended by 18 months. Additionally, Calabasas issued its own Executive Order to extend planning entitlements for an additional 180 days after the expiration of a state of emergency due to COVID-19.

## C. ENVIRONMENTAL AND INFRASTRUCTURE CONSTRAINTS

## 1. Environmental Constraints

## Hillside and Ridgeline Areas

Many areas in Calabasas consist of slopes where the topography acts as a limitation to various types of development. Moderately sloped areas present minor limitations due to the need for excavation and grading. Steeper slopes present severe limitations, requiring extensive excavation and possibly blasting during construction. In addition, development potential in some steeply sloped areas is limited due to lack of access and utilities.

The City has established Hillside and Ridgeline development standards to protect the public health and safety with regard to fire hazards and slope stability and to ensure that buildings are located in the most accessible, least visually prominent, and most geologically stable portions of the hillside or ridgeline. These standards apply to proposed developments on sites with a natural slope greater than ten percent or that include a designated ridgeline, which are located along the western, central, and southern portions of the City. The City requires buildings to be sited where they will be screened by existing vegetation, rock outcroppings, or depressions in topography. In wooded areas, dispersed buildings are preferred because they save trees and minimize visual impacts. The City also requires structures placed on or near ridgelines to be situated so that they do not appear silhouetted against the sky when viewed from any roadways designated as a scenic corridor. Ridgeline buildings are to be located in a way that maintains the natural appearance of the ridge. Hillside and ridgeline developments are required to provide two off-street parking spaces for guests in addition to the parking normally required for a residence.

Consistent with Calabasas' commitment to foster environmentally responsible development, the City's 2030 General Plan Safety Element includes the following policy:

Policy VII-4 Discourage development within potential landslide areas with severe soil limitations as the City's preferred management strategy, and a higher priority than attempting to implement engineering solutions.

## **Significant Ecological Areas**

Other constraints to development include Los Angeles County Significant Ecological Areas (SEAs) in the City and surrounding areas. SEAs contain unique or unusual plant and/or species assemblages, or areas or habitat that are rapidly declining in the Los Angeles area. While development within the City is not subject to the County's restrictions or limitations on developments within SEAs, these Los Angeles County SEAs may not be feasibly developed or may require extensive mitigation to ensure that plant and animal species are preserved. Currently, there is one Los Angeles County SEA in and around Calabasas, the Santa Monica Mountains SEA, which are located along the southern and western portions of the City.<sup>14</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Los Angeles Department of Regional Planning. 2019. Figure 9.3 Significant Ecological Areas and Coastal Resources Areas Policy Map. <a href="https://planning.lacounty.gov/site/sea/maps/">https://planning.lacounty.gov/site/sea/maps/</a>

## **Earthquakes and Seismic Hazards**

The City's geology and close proximity to the Malibu Coast Fault, San Fernando Fault, and Simi-Santa Rosa Fault, as well as other active regional faults, such as the San Andreas Fault, may pose some concerns for development. These faults could produce strong earthquakes which would generate substantial ground shaking, and potentially trigger liquefaction, landslides, mud, and debris flow during a period of heavy rain. Although it is not possible to prevent earthquakes, their destructive effects can be minimized though comprehensive hazard-mitigation programs and efforts. As identified in the 2030 General Plan Safety Element, the City requires building design to be commensurate with the expected level of ground shaking in a major earthquake, based on site-specific soils and geologic conditions, as well as on the level of risk associated with the potential damage to the building. For all buildings, once environmental protection policies are met, construction techniques are regulated according to the latest edition of the California Building Code (CBC) with City of Calabasas amendments or increased requirements as necessary to reduce geologic and seismic risks to acceptable levels.

Soils with a high clay content found in the natural portions of the City, such as in the Santa Monica Mountains, may present limitations to urban development due to their shrink-swell potential. Areas with expansive soils can cause problems such as damage to building foundations if not properly mitigated prior to construction. However, the City requires geologic studies prior to development to evaluate the potential for geologic and soil hazards, and requires these conditions to be corrected during construction. Typical measures to treat expansive soils involve removal, proper fill selection, and compaction. The 2030 General Plan EIR concludes that expansion should not be a significant constraint to development of individual sites provided that adequate soil and foundation studies are performed prior to construction.

As identified in the 2030 General Plan Safety Element, potential liquefaction hazard zones are located in portions of Calabasas. In particular, areas in the western portion of the City in the vicinity of Las Virgenes Creek may be subject to seismically induced liquefaction. Prior to approval of development projects in liquefaction or landslide hazard zones, site-specific engineering studies are required to analyze the feasibility or most appropriate design and construction techniques to mitigate potential problems. The 2030 General Plan EIR concludes that liquefaction impacts are less than significant with implementation of the Calabasas Building Code and policies contained in the Safety Element.

#### **Floodplains**

The City generally falls into an area of minimum flooding, as defined by the Federal Emergency Management Agency. However, areas found along canyon bottoms along the alignments of the primary drainage courses of Las Virgenes Creek in the western portion of the City and Arroyo Calabasas in the south-eastern portion of the City are designated within 100-year flood potential zones. These canyon areas would have limitations on development. However, to protect existing development in these areas, the City participates in the Federal Flood Insurance Program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> California Department of Conservation. n.d. Fault Activity Map of California. https://maps.conservation.ca.gov/cgs/fam/

The City requires a development permit for any structure being built within a designated special flood hazard area, and the Municipal Code calls for all new buildings in the flood hazard area to be constructed with materials resistant to flood damage. New construction is required to be adequately anchored in order to prevent flotation, collapse or lateral movement of the structure. Equipment and other service facilities must also be designed to prevent water from entering or accumulating within its components during a flood.

#### Wildfire Hazards

Large areas of southern California are particularly susceptible to wildfire due to the regions' weather, topography, and native vegetation. The California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CalFire) ranks fire hazard of wildland areas of the state using four main criteria: fuels, weather, assets at risk, and level of service. According to CalFire, the entire City of Calabasas is in a Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zone and the historical record indicates that wildfire risk in and around the City is high. Most notably, the Woolsey Fire, which began on November 8, 2018 and was contained on January 1, 2019, burned 96,949 acres in Ventura and Los Angeles counties. The fire destroyed 1,643 structures, damaged an additional 341 structures, and caused three fatalities total. In Calabasas, at least nine single-family homes were destroyed, two commercial buildings were badly damaged, and dozens of commercial and residential buildings were damaged. In addition to wildfire, the City could also experience structural fires, which occur in buildings, and industrial fires, which generally result from the ignition of flammable materials.

As identified in the 2030 General Plan EIR, a number of fire safety requirements and regulations apply to new development in the City. These include, but are not limited to, driveway width requirements, sprinklers, alarms, and maintaining adequate pressure and supply for hydrants. The 2030 General Plan Safety Element includes the following policies to specifically address wildfire hazards and development in the City:

Policy VII-12 Emphasize prevention of physical and economic loss associated with wildland fire through early identification of potentially hazardous conditions prior to project approval.

Policy VII-14 Discourage development and encourage sensitive siting of structures within hazardous fire areas as higher priorities than attempting to implement fuel modification techniques that would adversely affect significant biological resources.

Policy VII-15 Require design and siting of new development within areas subject to wildfires in a manner that minimizes the threat of loss from wildland fire.

Policy VII-16 Ensure that new development is designed so as to facilitate access by firefighting equipment and to maintain adequate evacuation routes.

Policy VII-17 Do not permit development within areas that do not have adequate water pressure or fire flows until sufficient pressure and fire flows can be reliably provided.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CalFire). 2008. Calabasas Very High Fire Hazard Severity Zones in LRA. https://osfm.fire.ca.gov/media/5809/calabasas.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> The California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CalFire). 2019. Woolsey Fire. https://www.fire.ca.gov/incidents/2018/11/8/woolsey-fire/

#### 2. Infrastructure Constraints

Another consideration for new development is the cost of providing adequate infrastructure, major and local streets, curbs, gutters, sidewalks, water and sewer lines, and street lighting, which must be built or installed in new development. In most cases, these improvements are dedicated to the City, which is then responsible for their maintenance. The cost of these facilities is borne by developers, adding to the cost of new housing units, and eventually passed on to the homebuyer or property owner. Maintaining adequate evacuation routes throughout the City is of particular concern in the community. As described in the 2030 General Plan, new development must facilitate access by firefighting equipment and maintain adequate evacuation routes.

The Las Virgenes Municipal Water District (LVMWD) provides both water and wastewater service in Calabasas. In accordance with State mandates, LVMWD has developed an Urban Water Managements Plan (UWMP), which is updated every five years. The UWMP is a planning tool that generally guides the actions of water management agencies, providing managers and the public with a broad perspective on a number of water supply issues. Based on conservative water supply and demand assumptions out to 2040, the 2015 LVMWD UWMP identifies sufficient water supply to meet demand. Analysis of the potable water system in the Integrated Water System Master Plan in 2014 resulted in recommended improvements to enhance system operations and reliability. Recommendations include piping, storage and pumping improvements. Implementing these projects would improve LVMWD's potable water infrastructure and optimize recycled water use to meet the existing and projected demand but do not change the availability of existing supplies or result in new supplies. The UWMP does not identify any wastewater treatment capacity issues.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Las Virgenes Municipal Water District. 2016. 2015 Urban Water Management Plan Final. https://www.lvmwd.com/home/showdocument?id=6877

# IV. REVIEW OF PROGRAM ACCOMPLISHMENTS

State Housing Element law requires communities to assess the achievements under their adopted housing programs as part of the update of the Housing Element. The 2014 Calabasas Housing Element contains a set of goals, policies and programs for the eight-year time frame of the housing element (2014-2021). Table 31 reviews each of the twenty programs in the Housing Element, including progress in implementation, effectiveness and continued appropriateness for the updated Housing Element. The results of this analysis will help to shape the comprehensive housing program strategy developed for the 2021-2029 Housing Element update.

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

Program/Action	Accomplishments
1. Single-family Rehabilitation Program  Action: Assist 5 households annually, for 40 units over the planning period.	<b>Progress:</b> Between 2014-2020, the City assisted 28 households rehabilitate their homes using CDBG funds. <b>Effectiveness:</b> The program has been effective in providing financial assistance to lower income homeowners to help improve their homes. While the City assisted an average of four households annually rather than its goal of five, it assisted a far greater number of extremely low
promise person	and very low income households than anticipated.  Continued Appropriateness: With the ongoing need to maintain the city's older housing stock, and mobile homes in particular, this program remains appropriate to the 2021-2029 Housing Element.
2. Home Repair Program  Action: Coordinate with code enforcement to identify low/mod homeowners and provide loans on as needed basis.	Progress: This program was initiated in 2012 to assist low and moderate income homeowners of severely dilapidated units cited for code violations to make needed repairs. In 2019, the City expanded the program to also offer loans for the development of accessory dwelling units (ADUs) to help meet the City's housing needs. The first \$50,000 loan was issued in 2020 to assist a senior homeowner convert a garage into an ADU.  Effectiveness: As currently structured, this program has had limited success. Refining the program to better assist low and moderate income homeowners add an ADU to their property could be a more effective use of funds.  Continued Appropriateness: Evaluate refocusing this program on
	providing financial assistance to support the creation of ADUs, and include the revised program in the updated Element.

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
3. Rental Assistance Program  Action: Provide ongoing assistance to 50 households, contingent on funding.	Progress: The City has continued to provide rental assistance to lower income, senior and disabled households. Rental payments are adjusted annually based on CPI, and have increased from \$190 to \$250/month during the planning period. As of October 2020, this program was providing assistance to 50 households with 42 of these households residing in the mobile home park.  Effectiveness: The program is effective in addressing one of Calabasas' primary affordable housing needs – rental overpayment – and encompasses assistance to those most in need, senior households earning lower incomes.  Continued Appropriateness: The program assists households at-risk of displacement due to rising rents, and remains appropriate to the Housing Element update.			
4. Rental Registration Program  Action: Continue to maintain the rental database.	Progress: Annual rent information provided by apartment owners is entered into the City's rental database in July every year, and reported to the City Council.  Effectiveness: The program provides an effective tool to monitor rent levels in the community, and to ensure 60-day notification of any rent increase in excess of 5%.  Continued Appropriateness: AB 1482 (effective 1/2020) provides additional tenant protections, including limits on annual rent increases and prohibition of evictions and non-renewals of leases without just cause. The Rental Registration program should be updated in the Housing Element to reflect these new tenant protections offered under State law.			
5. Mobile Home Park Preservation  Action: Should tenants indicate interest in purchasing their mobile home park, provide information on the State's MPROP (Mobilehome Park Rehabilitation and Resident Ownership Program) funding and assist with the subdivision map waiver process.	Progress: The City maintains the mobile home park designation for Calabasas Village Mobile Estates under both the General Plan and Development Code, and provides rental assistance to many of the park's residents. The City has had meetings with both the mobile home park property owner and HOA to assist with negotiating the park's long-term lease.  Effectiveness: The City's actions have been effective in preserving the mobile home park. Space rents have however been increasing, pursuant to the terms of the lease agreement.  Continued Appropriateness: This program remains appropriate to the Element. The City will provide the HOA with information on funding available through the State's MPROP program to assist in mobile home park purchase, as well as long-term loans to individuals to ensure continued affordability.			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
6. Preservation of Assisted Housing  Action: Preserve 140 at-risk units. Conduct economic analysis; meet with property owner; explore outside funding/program options; provide technical assistance to tenants.	Progress: The City had identified 140 affordable units at Malibu Canyon at risk of going to market rate because the associated bonds were set to expire in 2016. Subsequently, the City was informed in 2017 of Avalon Bay's (formerly Archstone Calabasas) intent to pay off their 2028 bond early, putting an additional 120 affordable units at risk of conversion. The City followed the steps outlined in the Housing Element program to work towards preservation, but was unsuccessful in both cases. Discussions with both the Los Angeles Community Development Commission (CDC) and California Housing Partnership (CHPC) informed the City that without significant financial resources, options to preserve these bond projects were quite limited. Effectiveness: The City undertook the following steps identified in the Housing Element to preserve the at-risk units:  ➤ Conducted economic analysis to determine the cost of buying down the rents which proved too costly as it would exhaust City's Affordable Housing Trust Fund in just 2 years.  ➤ Staff researched outside funding opportunities, including from LA County, but was unable to identify adequate funds for long-term preservation. Because ownership of Avalon Bay is a Real Estate Investment Trust (REIT), they are unable to use tax credits to extend affordability commitments.  ➤ Met with both property owners to discuss options for preservation. Malibu Canyon was not interested in preservation, but Avalon Bay subsequently submitted an initiative to construct 161 new apartments on the site, in exchange for preservation of 80 of the original 120 affordable units. The initiative was not approved by the voters at the March 3, 2020 election.  ➤ City staff has been available to provide assistance to each tenant explaining their rights and conversion procedures, and has proactively updated the City's website to include resources for tenant rights and other affordable housing options within the City and the region.  Despite these actions, the program was not effective in preserving these affo			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
7. Condominium Conversion Ordinance  Action: Implement the City's current ordinance. Evaluate strengthening to require inclusionary units in projects approved for conversion.	Progress: Between 2014 and 2019, there were no applications for condominium conversions and no inclusionary housing requirements imposed on condominium conversions.  Effectiveness: Calabasas's condominium conversion regulations are designed to help mitigate the impacts on tenants of the units undergoing conversion by regulating noticing procedures and mandating relocation payments to cover the costs of moving.  Appropriateness: The City's condominium conversion regulations remain an appropriate mechanism to ensure the safety and quality of units and to help mitigate the impacts on displaced tenants.			
8. Residential Sites Inventory  Action: Maintain current inventory of residential sites, and provide to interested developers in conjunction with information on incentives. Monitor impact of max 20 du/acre densities on feasibility, report on in annual Housing Element Report to HCD, and modify maximum density as appropriate.	Progress: The Community Development Department staff continues to maintain a current inventory of residential sites for potential development. Three mixed income projects received planning entitlements during the planning period with densities ranging from 15 to 22 units/acre.  Effectiveness: The City has been highly effective in providing information to the development community on site opportunities.  Continued Appropriateness: Maintaining an inventory of suitable sites to address the City's regional housing needs (RHNA) remains an appropriate program for the Housing Element. The City will consider allowing higher residential densities at select locations as part of the updated Element.			
9. Second Units  Action: Re-evaluate second unit standards and educate public on availability. Prepare design guidelines and sample site plans. Seek to achieve 12 new second units.	Progress: The City updated its second unit ordinance (now referred to as accessory dwelling units, or "ADUs") in January 2020, consistent with the most recent changes in State law governing ADUs and Junior ADUs. During the first seven years of the planning period (2014-2020), a total of 22 building permits were issued for ADUs, with an additional nine applications in process at the end of 2020, well exceeding the eight-year goal for 12 units.  Effectiveness: The City's new ADU regulations have been effective in producing new units. The City has begun collecting information on anticipated rent levels as part of the ADU application, providing information on the affordability of these units in the community.  Continued Appropriateness: ADUs provide housing opportunities for seniors, caregivers, and other modest income households, and thus a continuation of the program remains appropriate to the Element. Pursuant to new Housing Element requirements, the current program will be augmented to incentivize and promote ADUs, such as through creation of architectural prototypes and funding assistance offered through the City's Home Repair Program.			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
10. Annexation of Unincorporated Areas  Action: Pursue phased annexation of adjacent unincorporated areas.	Progress: The City initiated annexation proceedings for two areas: West Agoura Road and Craftsman Corner. The West Agoura Road annexation was ultimately denied by LAFCO, but the Craftsman Corner annexation is still in process, this area recently added to Calabasas' sphere of influence annexation and the Tax Exchange Agreement currently being developed with the County.  Effectiveness: The City has been diligently working towards annexation of the 145 acre Craftsman's Corner into Calabasas. The City's 2030 General Plan includes a vision to revitalize Craftsman's Corner as part of the City's "East Village" area, offering additional sites for mixed use development.  Continued Appropriateness: Annexation of Craftsman Corner is in process and remains appropriate to the updated Element.			
11. Inclusionary Housing Program  Action: Provide developers with information on available options and incentives to fulfill inclusionary requirements. Identify specific projects and programs for expenditure of inlieu fee revenues.	<ul> <li>Progress: The City continues to utilize the Inclusionary Housing Ordinance as a tool to integrate affordable housing within market rate developments. During the planning period, the following projects have been developed or received entitlements:         ✓ Avanti Calabasas – 80 condominiums, including 8 very low income rental units         ✓ Paxton Calabasas – 78 townhome apartments, including 4 very low income units         ✓ Calabasas Creekside (Raznick) Senior Apartments – 42 apartments, including 5 very low income units         </li> <li>Both Avanti and Calabasas Creekside were granted density bonus incentives to help offset the cost of providing affordable units.         Effectiveness: With 17 affordable units produced during the planning period, the ongoing use of the mandatory inclusionary housing program has been key to Calabasas' success in producing affordable housing.         Continued Appropriateness: The inclusionary program remains appropriate for the updated Housing Element.     </li> </ul>			
12. Commercial/ Industrial Impact Fee Program  Action: Provide affordable housing opportunities to Calabasas' workforce. Identify specific projects and programs for expenditure of impact fee revenues.	Progress: During the first six years of the planning period (2014-2019), approximately \$147,000 in commercial impact fees were deposited into the Affordable Housing Fund, bringing the total Fund balance to \$1.6 million (June 2020).  Effectiveness: While the City has had limited commercial development, funds generated nonetheless assist in addressing affordable housing needs. City Council has directed \$500,000 in Affordable Housing Fund revenues towards the Home Repair and ADU Loan Program.  Continued Appropriateness: As one of the City's few sources of funds to support affordable housing, the Commercial/Industrial Impact Fee program remains appropriate to the Element.			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
13. Affordable Housing Development Assistance  Action: Provide financial, regulatory and site identification assistance in support of affordable housing, with the goal to achieve one project in planning period.	Progress: As discussed under the Inclusionary Program above, three mixed income projects were entitled and/or constructed during the planning period, providing 17 very low income units. The City provided density bonus incentives and concessions on two of these projects. In addition, the City provided a \$50,000 low interest loan to a low/mod household for conversion of a garage into an ADU.  Effectiveness: The City's regulatory and financial incentives have been effective in producing affordable units.  Continued Appropriateness: Providing assistance in support of affordable housing remains appropriate to the Housing Element.			
14. Green Building  Action: Implement Green Initiative and promote the City's Green Building Program.	Progress: The City has adopted the 2019 California Building Standards Code, including the California Energy Code and the CALGreen Code. Each of these codes have increased measures for energy efficiency, resource conservation, green building, and sustainability. The City's comprehensive Green Initiative encompasses numerous programs aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions, using finite natural resources more efficiently, and improving the quality of the environment. Programs which fall under this initiative include: Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE) Retrofit Program; Recycling Program; Polystyrene and Single-Use Plastic Straw & Cutlery Ban; Secondhand Smoke Control Ordinance; Alternative Fuel Vehicle Fleet; and Watershed Management Programs. Effectiveness: The City has implemented CALGreen and provides information to the public about green building and the City's Green Initiative via the website.  Continued Appropriateness: Promoting energy conservation and sustainable design in new and existing development remains appropriate to the updated Housing Element.			
15. Density Bonus Program  Action: Promote density bonus incentives via dissemination of the Affordable Housing brochure.	Progress: Staff provides information on density bonus incentives and inclusionary housing requirements to all project applicants. The Avanti mixed-use project and Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments were both granted density bonuses during the planning period. In addition, the pending West Village project is also proposing use of density bonus incentives. While the City did not prepare an Affordable Housing brochure, the City includes information on affordable housing incentives on its website.  Effectiveness: This program has been effective in facilitating the production of mixed income housing in the City.  Continued Appropriateness: Providing density and other incentives to facilitate the production of affordable housing remains appropriate to the Element.			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments				
Program/Action	Accomplishments			
Action: Amend the Code to reduce separation requirement between shelters to 300 feet.	Progress: The City has not yet amended the Development Code to reduce the minimum distance between emergency shelters from 1,000 to 300 feet. The City has not, however, had any inquiries or applications for an emergency shelter.  Effectiveness: This program has not been implemented.  Continued Appropriateness: Amendment of the Code to reduce shelter separation requirements consistent with SB 2 remains appropriate to the Element. Pursuant to AB 139, the amendment will also encompass changes to the parking standards for shelters from a ratio based on shelter size to a ratio based on the number of shelter staff.			
17. Fair Housing Program  Action: Contract with the Housing Rights Center (HRC) to promote open and fair housing practices, and to facilitate communication between tenants and landlords. Assist in program outreach through referrals and distribution of educational info.	Progress: Calabasas continues to contract with the Housing Rights Center (HRC) to provide housing discrimination assistance and tenant/landlord information. The City provides information on its website regarding fair housing services offered through HRC.  Effectiveness: The City's fair housing program is effective in providing services and education regarding housing discrimination and tenant/landlord rights and responsibilities.  Continued Appropriateness: Fair housing services remain appropriate to the updated Element.			
18. Universal Design/ Visitability  Action: Develop Universal Design and Visitability brochure, and provide to residential builders.	Progress: The City has adopted reasonable accommodation procedures as part of the Development Code, and offers grants to qualified low income households for needed accessibility improvements. The City did not however implement a Universal Design program.  Effectiveness: The program was not implemented.  Appropriateness: Ensuring persons with disabilities continue to have fair access to housing remains important and will be implemented through reasonable accommodation policies as well as through the fair housing program. A Universal Design program is not viewed as appropriate for the updated Housing Element.			
19. Senior Housing Opportunities  Action: Actively pursue senior housing opportunities and housing support services. Consult with senior housing and gerontology experts to assist in adequately planning for the community's senior citizens.	Progress: The new Senior Center opened in 2016 on the Civic Center property, and offers a variety of recreational and support services to seniors. The City granted planning entitlements to a new senior housing facility, Calabasas Creekside Senior Apartments, which will provide 42 apartments, including 5 very low income units. Effectiveness: With the opening of the new Senior Center, a broad range of support services are offering to Calabasas' seniors, including housing referrals to independent senior living, assisted living, board & care, and memory care facilities.  Continued Appropriateness: Senior citizens continue to represent a growing segment of Calabasas' population. Providing a variety of housing opportunities and support services remains an appropriate program for the Element.			

Table 31: 2014-2021 Housing Element Accomplishments

20. Housing Opportunities for Persons Living with Disabilities  Action: Work in cooperation with the NLACRC to publicize information on available  Progress: Within zip code 91302, which encompasses greater Calabasas, the North Los Angeles Regional Center (NLACRC) currently provides services to 159 residents with developmental disabilities, indicative that NLACRC's resources are well publicized. Among these residents, approximately 97 percent live with a parent, family member or guardian and three percent live in a foster/group home or an independent/supportive living program. a community care	Program/Action	Accomplishments
resources for housing and services. Pursue State and Federal funds available for supportive housing and services in future affordable housing projects.  facility. These percentages highlight the need for people with developmentally disabled family members to have a variety of housing choices to provide ongoing care and support.  Effectiveness: The City provides a link to the North Los Angeles Regional Center on its housing resources webpage on the City website, and has been effective in providing information on services available through the Regional Center for persons with developmental disabilities.  Appropriateness: This program remains appropriate to the Housing Element.	20. Housing Opportunities for Persons Living with Disabilities  Action: Work in cooperation with the NLACRC to publicize information on available resources for housing and services. Pursue State and Federal funds available for supportive housing and services in future affordable housing	Progress: Within zip code 91302, which encompasses greater Calabasas, the North Los Angeles Regional Center (NLACRC) currently provides services to 159 residents with developmental disabilities, indicative that NLACRC's resources are well publicized. Among these residents, approximately 97 percent live with a parent, family member or guardian and three percent live in a foster/group home or an independent/supportive living program. a community care facility. These percentages highlight the need for people with developmentally disabled family members to have a variety of housing choices to provide ongoing care and support.  Effectiveness: The City provides a link to the North Los Angeles Regional Center on its housing resources webpage on the City website, and has been effective in providing information on services available through the Regional Center for persons with developmental disabilities.  Appropriateness: This program remains appropriate to the Housing

# Summary of Progress and Continued Appropriateness of 2014-2021 Goals, Polices and Programs

The goals and policies of the 2014-2021 Calabasas Housing Element remain appropriate to the updated element, and all of the Element's housing programs remain appropriate for continuation.

The Table below summarizes the quantified objectives contained in the City's 2014-2021 Housing Element, and compares the City's progress in fulfilling these objectives:

Table 32: Progress Towards 2014-2021 Quantified Objectives

Income Level	New Construction (2014-2020)		Rehabilitation (2014-2020)		Conservation	
	Goal	Progress	Goal	Progress	Goal	Progress
Extremely Low	44		1	8	50	50
Very Low	44	15	1	7		
Low	54		38	13	140	0
Moderate	57	8				
Above Moderate	131	184				
Total	330	207	40	28	190	50

**New construction** goal reflects Calabasas' 2014-2021 RHNA. Of allocation for 88 very low income units, half is allocated to extremely low income and half to very low income households. Progress includes **Rehabilitation** goal and progress reflects the Residential Rehabilitation Program.

**Conservation** goal and progress reflects the City's Rent Subsidy Program, and Preservation of low income at-risk housing.

New Construction: The City's 2014-2021 Housing Element was adopted on December 11, 2013. A major focus of the General Plan on which the Housing Element is based was to provide expanded sites for multi-family and mixed use development at appropriate densities to address the City's regional housing needs (RHNA), along with a comfortable sites buffer. And while the Element provided sufficient sites capacity, the actual number of units constructed during the 2014-2020 period (207) represents just 63 percent of the City's RHNA (330). Through the City's inclusionary ordinance, the City was able to achieve twelve very low income units integrated within market rate developments, with entitlements for an additional five very low income units. In addition, the City issued building permits for 22 accessory dwelling units (ADUs), and based on information collected by the City on units to be occupied family members or household staff rent-free, along with review of rent levels on Zillow, three of these ADUs are affordable to households earning very low incomes and eight are affordable to moderate income households.

**Rehabilitation:** In terms of rehabilitation, the City's goal was to assist five households per year, for a total of 40 households. During 2014-2020, the City was successful in assisting 28 lower income households rehabilitate their homes using CDBG funds. While the City assisted an average of four households annually, it assisted a far greater number of extremely low and very low income households than anticipated.

Conservation: The City's conservation goal included continued provision of monthly rental subsidies to 50 households via the Rental Assistance Program, which the City has continued to maintain, as well as increasing the subsidy amount. The second component of the conservation goal was for preservation of the 140 at-risk bond units in Malibu Canyon Apartments at risk of going to market rate because the associated bonds were set to expire in 2016. Subsequently, the City was informed in 2017 of Avalon Bay's (formerly Archstone Calabasas) intent to pay off their 2028 bond early, putting an additional 120 affordable units at risk of conversion. A described earlier in Section II.H, the City followed the steps outlined in the Housing Element program to work towards preservation of both these projects, but was unfortunately unsuccessful in both cases.

## V. ENERGY CONSERVATION OPPORTUNITIES

"Green buildings" are structures that are designed, renovated, re-used or operated in a manner that enhances resource efficiency and sustainability. These structures reduce water consumption, improve energy efficiency and lessen a building's overall environmental impact. The City of Calabasas is committed to securing its long-term sustainability by implementing a green initiative to improve the quality of the environment, reduce greenhouse gas emissions and use finite natural resources efficiently. The City's green initiative is aimed at promoting environmentally responsible development, upgrading existing city facilities, and educational outreach.

Calabasas adopted its first green building ordinance in January 2004, requiring all new and substantially renovated non-residential buildings greater than 500 square feet in size to utilize environmentally efficient site and building design, sustainable construction practices, and rapidly renewable or recycled building materials. On September 23, 2009, City Council adopted the California Green Building Standards Code, which now applies to all projects within the City, including residential. This Code was updated in November 2010 and again in January 2011.

Calabasas' green initiative encompasses numerous activities summarized on the City's Green City webpage, with numerous links to outside resources. The following highlights some of the City's green projects and programs:

- ➤ Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE) Program City of Calabasas is working with Los Angeles County to provide energy efficient retrofits to its residents. The County is investing approximately \$11 million in federal grant funds to develop a PACE program to serve the county's 88 cities. The program is designed to encourage private property owners to invest in energy efficiency retrofits and is key part of a broader home retrofit program for LA County. The LA County PACE program is authorized under California's AB 811, which enables municipalities to provide private property owners with the ability to finance energy efficiency and renewable energy improvements through a voluntary property tax assessment that is paid back over 20 years.
- ➤ Calabasas Civic Center -In July 2008, the City of Calabasas completed construction of a high performance, resource-friendly Civic Center consisting of a City Hall and Public Library. Both buildings were designed to meet a "Gold" standard from the United States Green Building Council's (USGBC) Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) Green Building Rating System for new construction. Sustainable design features include the use of energy and water efficient HVAC and plumbing systems, recycled and locally manufactured materials, use of a "cool" energy star rated roof, drought tolerant landscaping, low flow irrigation system, use of recycled water for landscape, use of natural daylight, increased views, systems to monitor and provide healthy indoor air quality and much more. Both the City Hall and Public Library were awarded a LEED Gold Certification by the United States Green Building Council (USGBC) on January 20, 2010.

➤ **Recycling Program** – With the passage of AB 939, Calabasas has set up a number of recycling programs to ensure it meets and exceeds the State's goal of a 50 percent diversion rate including programs for curbside recycling, construction waste recycling, electronic waste recycling, and household hazardous waste round-ups. In addition, staff provides outreach and technical assistance to residents, businesses and the schools to maximize waste prevention and recycling.



> Alternative Fuel Vehicle Fleet - The City's vehicle fleet consists of automobiles, trucks, and vans for City employees and public transit shuttles and old-fashioned trolley cars to serve the public. Recognizing that gasoline automobiles standard using consume considerable energy and contribute significantly to air pollution, the City continues to build a vehicle fleet consisting of



alternative fuel vehicles that run off of compressed natural gas (CNG) or involve hybrid gas/electric engines to improve fuel efficiency. Recently, the City added nine hybrid vehicles to the City's fleet for use by inspectors, saving gallons of gas from being consumed each year.

- Green Rebates and Incentives The City's Green City webpage includes a comprehensive listing of available financial incentives for use of green appliances and utilities in single-family homes, multi-family structures, and commercial properties. The webpage also provides detailed information for residents on how to retrofit their homes to make them greener.
- > Polystyrene Ban In 2007, the City Council adopted an ordinance banning the use of Polystyrene (Styrofoam) by retail food establishments, nonprofit food providers and City facilities. The ordinance requires food establishments to use environmentally acceptable packaging.
- > Second-Hand Smoke Ordinance The City enacted a comprehensive second-hand smoke ordinance in 2006 which restricts smoking in all public places, including parks, sidewalks, parking lots, patios and outdoor balconies.



The Calabasas 2030 General Plan is predicated on creating a more sustainable community for existing and future residents. The Land Use Element establishes a new Mixed Use designation where people can live, work and shop without getting in their cars, and continues to permit the integration of residential uses in most commercial districts. The Conservation Element establishes numerous policies in support of sustainable development, including:

Promote neighborhood designs that minimize energy use – e.g. mixed-use development to allow residents to live where they work and shop

- Promote site design to minimize energy use e.g. maximize solar access by use of non-reflective glass on south facing walls
   Promote building designs that minimize energy use e.g. design buildings to
- maximize internal lighting
- > Promote incorporation of energy conservation measures in existing and new developments